# Translation Quarterly

No. 64 2012 Special Issue IV: Papers from the FIT Sixth Asian Translators' Forum

香港

翻

譯學會出

版



論壇專號(四) 屆亞洲翻譯家 第六十四期 第六十四期

Published by The Hong Kong Translation Society 《翻譯季刊》 二〇一二年六月 第六十四期 版權所有,未經許可,不得轉載。 *Translation Quarterly* No. 64, June 2012 All Rights Reserved

Copyright © 2012 THE HONG KONG TRANSLATION SOCIETY ISSN 1027-8559-64

### 

The Hong Kong Translation Society has entered into an electronic licensing relationship with EBSCO Publishing, the world's most prolific aggregator of full text journals, magazines and other sources. The full text of the *Translation Quarterly* can be found on EBSCO Publishing's databases.

## 翻譯季刊 Translation Quarterly

## 香港翻譯學會 The Hong Kong Translation Society

## 創刊主編 Founding Chief Editor

劉靖之 Liu Ching-chih

## 主編 Chief Editor

陳德鴻 Leo Tak-hung Chan

## 執行編輯 Executive Editors

倪若誠	Robert Neather	潘漢光	Joseph Poon
-----	----------------	-----	-------------

## 副執行編輯 Associate Executive Editors

李忠慶 Lee Tong King 邵 璐 Shao Lu

## 編輯委員會 Editorial Board

劉靖之 (主席) Liu Ching-chih (Chairman)
 陳德鴻 Leo Tak-hung Chan 金聖華 Serena Jin
 黎翠珍 Jane Lai 倪若誠 Robert Neather
 潘漢光 Joseph Poon 黃國彬 Laurence Wong

## 顧問委員會 Advisory Board

鄭仰平	Cheng Yang-ping		Mona Baker
賴恬昌	Lai Tim-cheong		Cay Dollerup
林文月	Lin Wen-yueh	葛浩文	Howard Goldblatt
羅新璋	Lo Xinzhang		Wolfgang Lörscher
余國藩	Anthony Yu	馬悅然	Göran Malmqvist
余光中	Yu Kwang-chung	沈安德	James St. André
			Gideon Toury

## 編務經理 Editorial Manager

李燕美 Samantha Li

## Translation Quarterly No. 64, June 2012

Special Issue IV: Papers from the FIT Sixth Asian Translators' Forum

## 目錄 CONTENTS

## 論文 Articles

翻譯中的語言意識形態	徐菊清
——以馬克•吐溫的《哈克歷險記》	
為例	
Intercultural Awareness in Professional	Hong Ping
Translators: Examples from Technical	
and Non-technical Documents	
Annotation and Adaptation: A Case	Zhang Meifang
Study of a Chinese Translation of	
Joyce's <i>Ulysses</i>	
Taken Out of Context: The Importance of	James L. Davis
Context in Japanese-into-English	
Translation	
	<ul> <li>——以馬克•吐溫的《哈克歷險記》 為例</li> <li>Intercultural Awareness in Professional Translators: Examples from Technical and Non-technical Documents</li> <li>Annotation and Adaptation: A Case Study of a Chinese Translation of Joyce's Ulysses</li> <li>Taken Out of Context: The Importance of Context in Japanese-into-English</li> </ul>

## 書評 Book Review

79 翻譯作為文化間的橋樑 ——A Critical History of New Music in China 楊燕官

97 稿約凡例 Guidelines for Contributors

- 101 徵求訂戶啟事 Subscribing to Translation Quarterly
- 103 訂閱表格 Subscription and Order Form

# 翻譯中的語言意識形態

——以馬克•吐溫的《哈克歷險記》為例

徐菊清

## Abstract

A Study of Language Ideology in Translation: Using Examples from Mark Twain's *Adventures of Huckleberry Finn* (by Chu-ching Hsu)

In order to find out how ideology is expressed textually in translation and how Taiwanese translators render "colloquial *language*" and "dialect" in translation, this study specifically sets out to investigate linguistic ideology and the translator's use of *idiolects in Chinese language translations of Twain's* Adventures of Huckleberry Finn, where there are dialogues written in a colloquial idiom and dialects originally used in Mississippi. Framed by and applying Lefevere's theoretical concept of translating as rewriting, this study extracts and examines some examples from several Chinese renditions of the novel, to illustrate how individual translators convey their ideology in their renditions and what translation strategies are employed. The findings of the study reveal that Chinese translators do employ different translation strategies to make the final product acceptable to target readers, thus confirming target language norms and poetics. Furthermore, there is also indication that the translator's personal ideology is significantly influenced by mother-tongue education and

linguistic ideology, as well as social and political changes in Taiwan.

## 一、前言

為了了解台灣譯者如何表現個人意識於翻譯原著的語言風格 和英文方言,本研究結合 Lefevere 理論,着重翻譯的過程及解決 策略,以馬克•吐溫的作品 Adventures of Huckleberry Finn (Twain 1961/1996)在台灣出版的翻譯為研究文本,以口語及方言翻譯 為例,探討譯者如何呈現"語言意識形態"於譯文中。Twain 用 口語式文體和方言寫成該書,開了一代文風;然而,也因其特有 文體寫法和英文方言用法,使譯者在翻譯時,遇到了相對的問 題,其與此研究主題有很大的相關性。更為重要的是,該書內容 適合不同年齡層讀者,不僅含原作者期望的青少年讀者,幾乎所 有年齡層的讀者,皆可輕易了解此書,也因為如此,不同時期的 複譯文應運而生,非常適合分析不同譯者之語言意識。

本文以 Twain 的英文原作與出版及發表於台灣的中文譯著為 主,分析台灣譯者如何處理原著中的口語式文體和方言。根據故 事中的二位主人翁哈克(Huck)和吉姆(Jim)的話語及特有的 方言為研究語料,本研究嘗試回答下列問題:

(一)台灣譯者如何處理 Twain 作品內"英文方言"及"口 語體文字"的語言風格?個別譯者採用哪些翻譯策略來詮釋及翻 譯原作語言風格和特色?

(二)使用台灣本土方言——台語(又稱閩南語)——於翻

譯文學作品中的時間與台灣語言意識、母語運動、台灣社會政治 的變遷及教育制度中強化的語言意識形態,是否對譯者用"台 語"來翻譯相關連,或者只是譯者個人語言的使用意識而已。

在此必須解釋的是,本研究所探討的譯文中的"語言意識形態",並不是像馬克斯主義中所謂的政治或經濟階級系統,而是以 Paul Simpson 所陳述的定義,"指個人或某一族群透過其語言的使用,所表現出某一地區特有的想法、信念及觀感"(1993:6)。因此台語是如何被用來翻譯外國文學,特別是原作中特有的方言及地區性的語言文字,台灣譯者如何表現其個人的思想及觀念,將是本研究的重點及目的。

## 二、理論背景

根據 Lefevere 理論,翻譯為文學作品樹立什麼形象,主要取 決於兩個因素;首先是譯者的意識形態(ideology),其次是當時 譯入語文學裏佔支配地位的詩學(poetics;1992:41)。"譯者的 意識形態"有時是譯者本身認同的,有時卻是贊助者 (patronage)強加於譯者的,因此譯者採用的翻譯策略,就是直 接受到其意識形態支配的表現。而"支配地位的詩學"是指文學 意義上的"詩學",又可指"翻譯詩學(translational poetics)",即是所謂的"文學觀念(對文學的本質、功能的認 識)、創作原則和文學範式"(查明建,2001:65)。此外,面 對原文語言和文化萬象(universe of discourse)所帶來的各種難 題,如原文作者在其原語世界文化內包含的對象(objects)、概

念(concepts)和習俗(customs)等等,譯者也會依據自己的意 識形態尋找解決辦法和翻譯策略。與此同時,譯者通常會嘗試在 原作和譯入語文化的文學觀之間求得平衡,希望兩者能夠相容。 因此,為了達到不同時代讀者的期望,相同或不同譯者會採用符 合當時當地所能接受的翻譯策略、意識形態、詩學、社會觀等因 素。重複翻譯同一原作,以應不同社會、時代、地區的讀者之需 求。中外許多研究(如 Muchnik 2003;李新朝及張璘,2008)相 繼證實了"複譯"的必要性。

提到翻譯,一般人認為,不外乎就是將原語轉換成目的語, 然而,除了文學典故很難在翻譯中重現之外,原文所用的詞語與 情緒或事物之間的關係,也是譯者不容易重現出來的部分,因為 這種關係深深植根於原語的文化裏。Lefevere(1992;1992a)也 一再重申:翻譯不僅僅是語言層面上的轉換,更是譯者對原作所 進行的文化層面上的改寫。原文詞語的涵義(connotations)、不 同層次的措詞(illocutionary level)、不同的方言(dialects)和個 人語言風格(idiolect),全都是很難翻譯的,因為它們都是原語 文化系統的一部分(Lefevere 1992: 56-58)。換句話說,如果原 文運用這些"語言文化成分"側重效果,而不是區區的傳意,那 麼,譯者就會陷於翻譯的困境裏。而且,譯者處理方言和個人語 言風格時,也會反映出譯者對某些群體的立場或看法;這種意識 形態,往往在其翻譯中顯現出來。

而語言,即是翻譯中的文字,是最直接且最重要元素,它不 僅可以表現及解決"語內"和"語外"言語行為的問題,更是表 現譯者自己意識形態的工具。語言不僅可以反映社會文化,更是 族群意識的象徵(Fishman 1972/1986)。通常,語言被用來凸顯

#### 翻譯中的語言意識形態

族群的存在,也是整個族群在整個社會文化活動時,用來表現共同體認的意識形態(黃宣範,1993/2008:174-175),又或者是用以表示對某一語言族群及聽眾的重視。

## 三、重要參考文獻之評述

在大批的原文與譯文的對比敘述分析的研究中,針對 Twain 的 Adventures of Huckleberry Finn 的翻譯作為研究主題的不少,主 要是因為書中特別方言用法與口語式的文體寫法,研究人員可以 從不同的角度來探討相關翻譯和語言問題。然而,有關中文翻譯 議題上,至今的研究主要着重在兩方面,一是針對翻譯策略來研 究,二是從讀者的角度來探討一文多譯的原因。

在 2001 年,林孺好在其碩士論文中不但自行翻譯小說 Adventures of Huckleberry Finn 前 13 章,還將其譯文與另外四本非 台灣譯者翻譯的譯文——黎裕漢(1985)、張友松(1993)、許 汝祉(1995)及倪鈞(1995)——相互比較,加以評析,討論譯 者如何在翻譯過程中保留小說中獨特的地方語言特色。值得一提 的是,林孺好不但大量使用"台語"來重新翻譯兩位主人翁哈克 (Huckleberry)及吉姆(Jim)的特有方言語彙,還以中文來述 "說"整個故事,以"會說中文主角(哈克)"為翻譯目標,視 為其翻譯風格(2001: 20)。此外,林孺好在對其他四本譯文比 較及評析時,不但以自己譯文為例,舉出身為譯者應該為了達到 其預設目標所採用的譯文風格。林孺好更針對小說中"方言英

語"與"標準英語"的差異作出說明,比較及評析自己譯文與其

他人的翻譯,實例說明譯者如何在中文譯本中呈現原作語言風格,並兼顧譯文的可讀性。

七年後,蔡孟琪(2008)收集五本 Adventures of Huckleberry Finn 的譯文——黎裕漢(1987)、文怡虹(2001)、林孺好 (2001)、賈文浩和賈文淵(2005)、張友松(2007)——為研 究文本,探討譯者如何呈現哈克與吉姆的方言特色。蔡孟琪自己 設計一份問卷,訪問 21 個讀者,調查讀者對這五種翻譯風格的 喜好程度。從蔡孟琪的分析可看出,譯文的"流暢易讀"是讀者 喜好的首選,雖然讀者同意原文中的方言特色應保留及呈現於譯 文中,但是"可讀性"仍是當代讀者偏好的。

同樣地,以特定讀者族群的翻譯文學需求為主題,張景華 (2006)針對兩位譯者張萬里和成時的 Adventures of Huckleberry Finn 譯文之政治傾向性進行對比分析,發現張萬里的翻譯較注重文本 的政治意義,而淡化作品的文學藝術;反之,成時的譯本卻淡化 了作品的政治色彩,將作品譯成為兒童文學的語言。根據其研 究,張景華指出,翻譯的文學作品不但反映了譯者不同政治意識 傾向,也反映了社會和讀者的需要,所以重譯同一文學作品,仍 然是不可缺少的。

此外,研究同一本小說,李新朝及張璘(2008)以接受美學 和讀者角度的理論為基礎,以歷時性的研究方法,檢視了自 1942 年起在中國內地已出版,包括全譯、編譯及簡譯所有 48 本在不 同時期所產生的譯文,分析比較原文及譯者在翻譯此書時所處的 政治時期和社會時代背景,來說明重譯的必要。更從不同時代讀 者的角度,來分析不同時期的譯文,並說明流傳眾多重譯本的必 然原因。

在德國,專注於"方言翻譯"問題,Berthele (2000/2009) 應用 Catford (1965/1974) 的"等同 (equivalence)"翻譯理論, 從計會語言學的角度,討論小說中黑人 Jim 所用英文方言的德譯 問題。以歷時性的研究方法,Berthele 收集 1890-1997 年間出版 的 13 本不同譯作, 但僅以小說 Adventures of Huckleberry Finn 中 Jim 說最多話的地方——第8章中一小節(共6段;746 個英文 單字)——的德譯文為研究分析語料。Berthele 將其所收集的 746 個單字所對應的德文翻譯,分為二大類屬性:(1)拼字特徵 (如省略字母發音或修飾詞、發音不正確及拼字錯誤等); (2) 其他拼字問題特徵(包括語法及句法誤用、用字風格及特 徵等),再進行比較及分類,來說明德國譯者如何使用非正統的 德文拼字方法,反映個別譯者所處之不同時期的社會真實面。研 究結果證實,不同譯者所採用的半標準或不標準的德文拼字,會 因譯者所處的地區特有的方言、社會時代、地區、歷史語言、內 涵義竟等而改變。Berthele 也發現不同時期出版的譯文,確實反 映出不同譯者所處的歷史時代及社會背景,同時也呈現出個別譯 者對 Twain 所寫的非裔美國黑人 Jim 的特殊語言用法及評價也不 一樣。

當然,作品複譯的現象也發生在其他社群中,從 Rosa (2000)的歷時性研究看到,複譯作品是研究譯入語當地政治、 社會、歷史環境及文化變遷對翻譯產生影響的直接證據。同樣, 一文多譯的問題,並不只限於不同譯者;因時代語言的變化,同 一譯者也會重譯同一文本。以希伯來文為例,Muchnik(2003) 比較同一譯者(Rivka Meshulach)兩次翻譯 Ibsen 的同一劇本 *An Enemy of the People*,兩個譯文相隔 20 年之久。通過檢視兩個譯本

及與譯者個人訪談,Muchnik 發現,因時代及社會政治的改變, 希伯來文文字常規(language norms)已明顯改變,語法及句法、 語義和句意已相當不同;這些改變也反映在譯文上。換言之,譯 者所選用的譯入語,會受目的語社會環境以及目的語自身的改革 及變化所影響,這直接反映於翻譯文學作品上。這同時也可說 明,因目的語讀者所處的時代及社會不同,重譯有其必要性。除 此之外,Muchnik 更指出,比較分析同一原著之不同譯文,是研 究及追查語言及社會發展的好方法(ibid.: 296)。如同 Toury (1995: 53-69)主張,針對同一原著,檢閱不同時期的翻譯文 本,是了解、分析某一社會中語言規範變化的方法之一,更可經 由不同的重譯文本,去了解語言及社會在某一特定時期的改變, 以便能更進一步了解其原因。

由上列的研究可以發現,譯文語言的使用,可能依目的語社 會、文化、環境及時代的變化,進行調整,而譯者也會因目的語 讀者預設之不同,而修正使用的書寫文字。然而,值得一提的 是,上述的研究,其語言的本質變化乃基於單一語言,所不同 的,只是古文及現代文或白話文的不同、社會語言和政治的改 變、及目的語讀者群之設定。然而,對於因地區不同,如何於譯 文中使用方言來取代正式官方語言的研究,幾乎沒有。更不用 說,讀者和目的語當地的社會政治、語言文化,甚至社會語言和 個人或族群語言意識的改變,是如何反映於翻譯文學作品,這是 值得高度關切及研究的。並且,前述的國內外參考文獻中,幾乎 沒有特別針對譯者語言意識形態的研究,或將目的語的"方言" 使用於翻譯中的研究,這着實顯示本研究的重要性。

## 四、文本分析與討論

小說 Adventures of Huckleberry Finn 中"英文方言"及"口語 體式文字"曾被台灣譯者依個人語言風格及意識形態,於不同的 社會時期中,進行不同程度的處理(manipulation),以使其譯文 能夠切合不同讀者的文化體系。首先,就翻譯文字的使用而言, 在台灣,用來翻譯的語言,以往大都以中文為主,即使是在外國 文學翻譯作品中,原作者為表現不同意旨而使用的特殊語言,例 如 Twain 的方言英語、Alice Walker 的黑人方言、James Joyce 的 語言轉換及創新,及許多作品內英文文字的拼字錯誤及不標準的 用法等等,大部分的中文譯者,仍以標準中文來翻譯(可參閱張 好菁[2007]),但可能用"同音異字"、"相似音字"、"錯別 字"、"聲調錯誤"等方式來處理,例如下列 Jim 和 Tom 的對 話,譯者使用"同音異字"及"相似音字"(灰雞 vs. 徽記)來 詮釋 got no coat o'arms vs. a coat of arms:

Jim says: "Why Mars Tom, I hain't *got no coat o'arms*; I hain't got nufn but ..."

"or, you don't understand, Jim; *a coat of arms* is very different." (Twain 1999: 264)

吉姆說:"唉,湯姆少爺,我有什麼<u>灰雞</u>呀!我什麼也沒有,只 有…。"

"呵,你不懂,吉姆,**徽記**是一種很特別的東西。"(蘇放,2001: 278) 然而,隨着時代改變、語言族群意識運動及語言認同的提 昇,使用"方言"來譯西洋文學的特殊語言,亦被接受並應用於 翻譯文學中。針對本研究的文本,也被多位台灣譯者用地方方言 ——台語或其特有的語言標記,亦是魏文真(1995)和林孺好 (2001: 20-21)所稱的"時貌標記(temporal marker)"——來 重新詮釋小說中的"英文方言"及"口語式文體";例如林孺好 在其論文中,大量用口語式中文及台灣地區特有的"有"字句來 翻譯此書,如小說的第一句:

You don't know about me, without you have read a book by the name of "The Adventures of Tom Sawyer", "but *that ain't no matter*. That book was made by Mark Twain, and he told the truth, *mainly* ... *is all told about in that book*—..." (Twain 1999: 13)

你要是<u>有看</u>過《湯姆歷險記》那本書,就多少知道我這個人。不過 <u>有看沒看</u>沒差<u>啦</u>。那本書是馬克,吐溫先生寫的,書上講的都是 真的,大部分<u>啦</u>。…那本書都<u>有講</u>到她們,就是那本書<u>嘛</u>,… (林孺好,2001:63)

林孺好翻譯 Huck 的話語,不但有意使用"有+動詞片語"如 "有看過"、"有看沒看"及"有講到"等,以表示某一事件的 存在或事情的完成與否(2001:21)。她還大量使用中文的句尾 助詞如上述句子中的"啦"、"嘛"、"了"等口語助詞,刻意 翻譯及詮釋 Twain 原著中的"口語式文體"。

不僅如此,林孺妤更使用"台語借詞"——即採用同台語發

#### 翻譯中的語言意識形態

音的漢字所形成的中文詞組(陳素月,1989:11-36)於譯文中:

... Then I set down in a chair by the window and tired to think of something cheerful, **but it wasn't no use** ... (Twain 1999: 16)

···然後在窗戶旁邊的椅子上坐下來,卯起來想一些愉快的事情,可 是沒什麼小路用,...(林孺好,2001:67)

她為何會運用台語漢字(如"沒什麼小路用")的翻譯策略來詮 釋 Twain 筆下 Huck 的話語?林孺好(2001:20)預設"如果哈 克會說中文,如果他要用中文重述他的歷險記,會用怎樣的語 言?",故她將書中的主角 Huck 轉換成一位十幾歲的台灣青少 年,再以此角色的"中文"來說故事,以呈現個人翻譯風格及語 言意識形態。

此外,林孺好(2001: 39)更用台語方言或發音不標準的 "台灣國語"來翻譯小說中的黑奴 Jim 不標準的英語發音及文 法:

> "Say—who is you? Whar is you? Dog my cats ef I didn' hear sumf'n. Well, I knows what I's gwyne to do. I's gwyne to set down here and listen tell I hears it agin." (Twain 1999: 18)

> "喂,你是啥人?你佇叨位?我一定有聽到啥米聲。好,我知影我 愛按怎做,我就惦遮坐落來聽,擱聽到彼耶聲為止。"(林孺好, 2001:68)

#### 《翻譯季刊》第六十四期

如譯者自述,使用台語或"'不標準的國語'的方式翻譯, 或許也能夠在譯文中表現原文的黑人英語和標準英語的差異,但 還是有不足之處",如讀者無法立即理解譯文等等(林孺好, 2001:39)。

採用類似方法,另一位台灣譯者廖勇超(2002)也同樣的以 "台語"或"台語借詞"來翻譯同一本小說中第 16 章中(此段 也被收錄於 Live in Mississippi《密西西比河上的生活》第 3 章內) 一小段的"方言"或"口語體文字"歌詞的譯文:

There was a <u>woman</u> in our	鎮上有一個 <b>查某人</b> ,	我們城裏有個 <u>花姑娘</u> ,
towdn,	伊就住在 <u>阮</u> 鎮上	就住在 <b>我們</b> 城裏,
In <u>our</u> towdn did dwed'l,	實在有夠愛 <b>伊九</b> ,	她非常愛 <u>她的丈夫</u> ,
She loved <u>her husband</u>	不過別的 <b>查脯人</b> 想要	卻給另一個 <u>人</u> 兒纏住
dear-i-lee,	娶伊	了。
But another <u>man</u> twyste as	對我唱,咡囉,咡囉,	也喜歡唱歌, 哩嚕, 哩
wed'l.	咡囉	· " " " " " " " " " " " " " " " " " " "
Singing too, riloo, riloo,	<u>一</u> <sup>元</sup> 呷多,咡囉,咡力人	『     『     『     『     『     『     『     『     『     『     『     『     『     『     『     『     『     『     『     』     』     』     『     』     『     』     』     』     『     』     『     』     』     』     』     』     』     』     』     』     『     』     『     』      』      』     』     』     』     』     』     』     』     』
riloo,	重在有夠愛 <u>伊九</u> ,	· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·
Ri-too, riloo, rilay e,	不過別的 <b>查脯人</b> 想要	动, 她非常愛 <u>她的丈夫</u> ,
She loved <u>her husband</u>	▼過加可 <u>■加八</u> 心女 娶伊	卻給另一個 <b>人</b> 兒纏住
dear-i-lee,	廖勇超(2002:130)	叩相方 回 <u>入</u> 儿燿Ц 了。
But another <u>man</u> twyste as	廖 <u>男</u> 旭(2002.130)	1
wed'l. (Twain 1999: 97)		齊霞飛(1981:21)

比對原文與中間一欄,譯者廖勇超(2004,個人訪談)有意 識地選用台語借詞的漢字及類似台語發音的注音符號如"尢"來 翻譯,其目的是為了凸顯原文中方言的使用;廖勇超預設其讀者 是台灣的居民,且這些台灣詞彙已廣為當地居民所使用,故讀者 會有較少的閱讀障礙及理解困難。

然而,並非所有台灣的譯者,都會採用類似語言轉換或替代 方式來翻譯原著中的方言,例如早期台灣譯者齊霞飛(1981)就

用標準國語來翻譯(如上例右方譯文),並沒有以某一特定"方 言"來翻譯原著中的英文"口語"或"方言"文字。然而,1990 年之後的譯著如吳蘭芳(1996)及文怡虹(2001),或多或少有 意無意地將"口語體文字"如"啦"、"嘛"、"了"等語助詞 用於翻譯,更將地方特有語言——台語借詞,如"阿達"、"猴 囝仔"應用於譯本內(吳蘭芳,ibid.:23,30)。

由上述例子,我們可以了解,使用台灣本土方言和應用台語 借詞的中文詞組來翻譯文學作品,已被台灣的出版社所接受,更 是呈現譯者個人風格、翻譯策略及語言意識形態的方法之一。探 究原因,譯者林孺好(2001: 40)解釋, "以台語(或台灣國 語)來翻譯黑人英語,僅是一項嘗試,希望能在譯文中表現黑人 英語與標準英語的差異,絕非意味輕視台語"。

又如故事中第一人稱敘述者 Huck 的語言,也被視作不標準 的方言英語,因此兩位譯者(林孺好和廖勇超)不約而同地採用 "口說"的方式來翻譯此小說;林孺好陳述其翻譯策略,是先將 Huck 的角色轉換成在台灣未受良好教育的 14 歲男孩子,從其角 度及說話方式用"中文"來"講"故事。為此,她在翻譯 Huck 的話語時,"考慮哈克的年紀、身世",運用當代在台灣的時髦 語言標記,包括"'有'、'然後'、'青少年流行用語'以及 '台語借詞'等特有詞彙,以求譯文能表現英文原作的語言特 色"(2001: 20-42)。

同樣地,以"說"故事的方式,廖勇超(2004,個人訪談) 在翻譯時,並非直接翻譯或輸入文字,而是先以中文"講"出翻 譯,再與朋友共同修改,以"說故事"方式翻譯,並書寫成譯 文,以求口語化及順暢。如此的翻譯步驟及方法,亦使得廖勇超

的譯文,出現大量只在當代台灣社會中出現的"口說"話語,如 無義意的語尾助詞"啦"、"嘛"、"囉"等,和"台語借詞" 如"別痟想"、"唬爛"等等。

值得探討的是,為何這些"台式"口語方言會使用於翻譯 中,處於意識形態與語言之間?由上可以很明確得知,譯者有目 的地呈現個人翻譯風格所採用的翻譯策略;由譯者對其自己譯文 的論述得知,林孺妤將 Huck 的角色轉換為當今十多歲的台灣青 少年,並以台灣時下常用的"口說"中文來翻譯,有目標地使用 當前台灣社會青少年所使用的語言標記、流行用語等,以求譯文 能表現英文原作的地方方言及語言特色(2001:39-42)。稍為不 同的,廖勇超(2004,個人訪談)則從讀者的角度來翻譯,以台 灣青少年和成人讀者為對象,先以中文"口譯"句子,再修改並 書寫成文字。經此翻譯策略,譯文相當口語化且順暢,並有意無 意地使用台灣當地居民所運用及接受的語言為目的語,產生了和 林孺妤(2001)類似的譯文。如此的翻譯現象證明了 Lefevere 的 論述,"譯者自己的意識形態和目的語當時及當地的詩學,對其 所採用的翻譯策略,具有相當的影響"(1992a:48)。

就意識形態與語言的關聯而言,如詹明信(Fredric Jameson)強調,"從語言的變化來研究對事物的態度或觀點", 是分析意識形態的方法之一;更重要的是,"意識形態從來就不 是個人的,而是群體的",它是"形成對群體實踐的肯定" (2001:73-75)。就翻譯而言,語言即是翻譯中的文字,更是譯 者直接表達其意識形態的重要工具。以台灣為例,自 1949 年國 民政府來台執政,為了增強國家民族意識,進行單一語言教育政 策,指定中文("國語")為台灣地區的官方語言,是唯一可使

#### 翻譯中的語言意識形態

用於學校、公開場所、書刊文字的語言。而"台語",又稱"閩 南語",長期以來,一直是台灣地區使用的"口語方言",但卻 是早於蔣中正來台之前所使用的本土語言,只不過統一文字沒有 形成。

直到 20 世紀 80 年代台灣本十運動崛起,強調重視及回歸 台灣既有的言語與文化,不僅開始用台灣本土語言書寫本土人 物、社會和生活,更將本十方言逐漸地和全面地運用於台灣社會 中(陳美如,2009:94-96)。在1987 解嚴後,本十語言已明顯 被大眾接受及使用,更在 1990 以後,因為台灣語言意識、母語 運動、台灣社會政治的變動以及語言教育制度等原因,在公共場 所中廣泛地被運用(Simpson 2007: 247-255; Wei 2006; 黃官範, 2008: 60-85)。在 2000 年政黨輪替,由民進黨取得執政權前, 本十語言的使用更一度成為國族認同的表徵,不僅政治人物要講 台語,學校及公開場所更廣為接受,這同時也促成本十語言"文 字化"的形成。更重要的是,在台灣的居民,將台灣方言,特別 是閩南語(台語),帶入國語(類似內地的普通話)中(黃馨 慧,1995:1),長期接觸及相互影響的結果,產生一些特有的語 言特徵,如前例中"有+動詞片語"、"然後",和"台語借 詞"等特有的語言風格及台語漢字詞彙的形式(魏文真,1995: 40) 。

因此,用台灣方言來轉換及呈現 Twain 小說中的英文方言, 成為台灣譯者支持譯入語語言文化的辦法之一。比對在台灣地區 的語言使用情形和演變,我們可以發現譯文中使用的文字着實隨 着語言政策而有所改變,例如在上述例子中齊霞飛(1981)使用 標準國語(中文)於全部譯文中,平實的翻譯完全無法呈現原著

中的英文方言。繼之,隨着台灣語言政策的轉移,母語及方言接 受度的提昇,隨着出版年代的不同,從少數的台語借詞漸漸地被 台灣譯者如吳蘭芳(1996)運用於譯文中,2000年以後出版的不 同譯者如林孺妤(2001)和廖勇超(2001)等大量地將台灣方言 文字化,並用台灣地區特有的語言標記來詮釋 Twain 原著中的英 文方言。如此翻譯語言的使用,就如同 Lefevere(1992,1992a) 指出,在不同的歷史條件下,譯者會依其個人意識形態及所處的 文化體系,對原著進行某些程度的改寫,使譯文符合譯者所處時 期社會中具有領導地位的意識形態和詩學或文學觀形態,以達到 其翻譯被大多數讀者所接受的目的。

## 五、結 論

語言的表達方式包括口語及文字,重要的是,語言的使用有 其文化涵意、意識形態。本研究以文學作品 Adventures of Huckleberry Finn 為例,經由上述的例子,仔細對比分析台灣譯者 如何翻譯原著中的"方言"及"口語體文字",以實際例子分析 說明,可以知道台灣譯者會因應不同社會和區域,為特定讀者群 而採用不同翻譯策略,有目的地呈現個人風格和當地的語言意識 形態。譯者採用不同的翻譯策略,刻意使用台灣地區特有的口語 式文體和方言,以設定目的語讀者,有意識地選擇翻譯語言,使 不同時期的複譯文應運而生。由此研究得知,翻譯過程中,譯者 成長及其所處的社會中的語言意識形態以及詩學等因素,確實會 影響譯者在翻譯過程中的語言策略。同時,翻譯不僅會反映出譯

入語的改變,而譯者個人意識形態及風格亦會影響其翻譯目的與 策略的使用,這直接反映在翻譯語言中。

本篇文章為台灣國家科學委員會研究計畫——"翻譯中的語言意 識型態——以馬克吐溫的小說為例(Language Ideology in Translation: Examples from Mark Twain's novels;計畫編號為 NSC 99-2410-H-231-017)"的部分成果。

## 參考文獻

- Berthele, Raphael (2009). "Translating African-American Vernacular English into German: The Problem of 'Jim' in Mark Twain's *Huckleberry Finn*". In *Translation Studies*. Ed. M. Baker. New York: Routledge. (Also in *Journal Sociolinguistics* 4.4 (2000): 588-613.)
- Fishman, Joshua A. (1972/1986). "Domains and the Relationship between Micro- and Macro- sociolinguistics". In *Directions in Sociolinguistics: The Ethnography of Communication*. Eds. J. J. Gumperz and D. Hymes. New York: Basil Blackwell.
- Lefevere, André (1992). Translating Literature: Practice and Theory in a Comparative Literature Context. New York: Modern Language Association of America.
   (1992a). Translation, Rewriting, and the Manipulation of Literary Fame. London: Routledge.
- Muchnik, Malka (2003). "Changes in Word Order in Two Hebrew Translations of an Ibsen Play". *Target* 15.2: 295-316.
- Rosa, Alexandra A. (2000). "The Negotiation of Literary Dialogue in Translation: Forms of Address in *Robinson Crusoe* Translated into Portuguese". *Target* 12.1: 31-62.
- Simpson, Andrew (2007). Language & National Identity in Asia. London & New York: Routledge.

#### 《翻譯季刊》第六十四期

- Simpson, Paul (1993). Language, Ideology, and Points of View. London & New York: Routledge.
- Toury, Gideon (1995). *Descriptive Translation Studies and Beyond*. Amsterdam: John Benjamins.
- Twain, Mark (1996/1999). Adventures of Huckleberry Finn. London & New York: Norton.
- Wei, Jennifer M. (2006). "Language Choice and Ideology in Multicultural Taiwan". Language and Linguistics 7.1: 87-107.

蔡孟琪(2008), 〈The Translation and Reception of Mark Twain's The Adventures of Huckleberry Finn in Taiwan / 馬克吐溫《哈克歷險記》譯本評析與台灣讀者反應研究〉,碩士論文,國立高雄第一科技大學。

- 查明建(2001),〈意識形態、翻譯選擇規範與翻譯文學形式庫——從多元 系統理論角度透視中國五十—七十年代的外國文學翻譯〉,《中外文 學》30.3: 63-92。
- 陳美如(2009),《台灣語言教育政策之回顧與展望》,高雄:復文。
- 陳素月(1989), 〈台語文字化研究〉, 碩士論文, 輔仁大學。
- 黃馨慧(1995),〈從社會語言學的觀點看台灣國語裏的一些句法變化〉, 碩十論文,國立清華大學。
- 黃宣範(1993/2008),《語言、社會與族群意識:台灣語言社會學的研究》,台北:文鶴。
- 李新朝、張璘(2008),〈《哈克》在中國之重譯與流傳〉,《西北林科技 大學學報(社會科學版)》8.1:136-140。
- 廖勇超譯(2002),《哈克流浪記》,台北:大田。
- \_\_\_\_\_(2004),個人專訪,台北:台灣大學旁的 Starbucks coffee shop, 7月 22日。
- 林孺妤(2001),〈Translation and Commentary of Mark Twain's The Adventures of Huckleberry Finn / 馬克•吐溫《哈克歷險記》之中譯與
- 評析〉,碩士論文,國立台灣師範大學。 齊霞飛譯(1981),《密西西比河上的生活》,台北:志文。
- 蘇放譯(2001),《頑童歷險記》,台北縣新店市:角色文化。

#### 翻譯中的語言意識形態

魏文真(1995),《國語的有字句》,碩士論文,國立清華大學。 文怡虹譯(2001),《頑童流浪記》,台北:小知堂發行。 吳蘭芳譯(1996),《頑童歷險記》,台中:三久。 詹明信(2001),《後現代主義與文化理論》,台北:合志文化。 張景華(2006),《以文學翻譯的傾向性論複譯的必要性——以《哈克貝利 •芬歷險記》的兩種譯本為例》,《北京第二外國語學院學報》(外 語版)8:14-19。 張好菁(2007),《A Corpus-based Study of the Chinese Translation of

A Corpus-based study of the Chinese Translation of A frican-American Vernacular English in Alice Walker's *The Color Purple* / 黑人方言語料庫翻譯研究——以艾莉絲•華克《紫色姐妹花》中文譯本為例〉,碩士論文,國立高雄第一科技大學。

## 作者簡介

徐菊清,英國倫敦大學亞非學院比較文學及翻譯學博士,現為台 灣清雲大學應用外語系助理教授。主要研究興趣為文化研究、敘 述性的翻譯研究、翻譯語料庫研究和社會語言學研究。

# Intercultural Awareness in Professional Translators: Examples from Technical and Non-technical Documents

Hong Ping

## Abstract

This paper examines the importance of developing intercultural awareness for professional translators. Translation is actually a cross-cultural activity used to enable smooth interaction between peoples from different cultures. It should take into account the cultural frame of the target language users. The major difference between foreign-language training and professional translator training is that while the former focuses on getting used to communicating in a foreign language, the latter tries to develop competence in reading/listening in one language and writing/speaking in another language. Intercultural awareness is of great help in the production of a user-friendly version for the target language reader.

Translation is actually a cross-cultural activity for smooth interaction between peoples from different cultures. In order to achieve such a purpose, translating should take into account the thinking patterns of

#### Intercultural Awareness in Professional Translators

the target language users. The major difference between foreign-language learning and translation training is that while the former focuses on getting used to communicating in a foreign language, the latter tries to develop the competence of reading or listening in one language and writing or speaking in another language, and the focus is on the appropriateness of a translation for the target culture.

Now, "translating across cultures" has become a buzz phrase and cultural proficiency is a prerequisite for a qualified translator. The words "culture" and "translation" are so closely linked that people tend to argue how translations can account for culture, or to what extent translation can overcome cultural barriers (Katan 1999: 7). This question can be sensibly discussed at three different levels: technical, institutional and general.

Conceptual terms have become easier to translate as different technical cultures come together under the global computer and communication umbrella since the beginning of the 21st century. Translating or interpreting discourse related to the new technologies across cultures will not pose much of a problem. For example, we can use our new lap top or cell phone that is imported from other countries without the help of a translator, for a multi-language system is installed in these machines. Once set up, all the menus are in our own language. There seem to be one-to-one equivalents between languages. The reason for such an easy formal equivalence is that the end-users of these gadgets share the same culture, a globally standardised culture of the computer. From this example, we can see that the ideal translation situation is where the language can be changed but the culture retained.

Technical culture involves communication at the level of science and technology. In some cases, it can be measured accurately, and has no meaning outside itself. Let us take the word *time* for example. *Time* has a variety of meanings, depending on context and culture. On the other hand, technical *time* refers only to the technical understanding of the concept and can be broken down into its *isolates* and analysed. One of its basic isolates is a second, which we all have a feel for, but a technical *second* does not give rise to feelings; a clear, unambiguous scientific definition of its duration exists.

Translating or interpreting at this level does not have to deal with any communication problem after the linguistic switch, as in the following example:

#### Example 1

今年一月,我國宣佈啟動太陽能聚光熱發電(CSP)工程。這項新 技術要比目前廣泛使用的光生伏打(PV)板技術節約成本。山東蓬 萊電力設備製造有限公司與美國太陽能發電供應商 eSolar 公司合 作,計畫在未來 10 年內在我國建立兩百萬千瓦太陽能熱電機組。 China unveiled its plans to develop concentrated solar thermal power (CSP), which is considered to be more cost-effective than more widely applied photovoltaic (PV) panel installations, in January, when China Shandong Penglai Electric Power Equipment Manufacturing teamed up with US-based solar thermal power maker eSolar to build a 2,000 megawatt solar thermal power installation in China within 10 years.

The translation of the above example shows three different aspects. Firstly, there is technical culture. For general translators, the most difficult may be the technical terms "太陽能聚光熱發電" and "光生伏打". They should be rendered in terms of the technical culture of those people working in the field of solar energy technology. Fortunately, the source text provides the English abbreviations *CSP* and *PV*, with which we could search for the meaning via the internet. Once you know their equivalents in the target culture, it will be quite easy:

#### Intercultural Awareness in Professional Translators

太陽能聚光熱發電——concentrated solar thermal power (CSP) 光生伏打板——photovoltaic (PV) panel

Secondly, there is institutional culture. The name of the Chinese enterprise should be rendered appropriately into English:

山東蓬萊電力設備製造有限公司——Shandong Penglai Electric Power Equipment Manufacturing

If their official English names appear on the web, they can be found easily. Actually, all the company names can be translated into the target language. For instance, the American *eSolar* could be rendered as "電子太陽能"公司, just as we render *e-mail* as "電子郵件", and *e-commerce* as "電子商務".

Thirdly, there is logical thinking. One of the examples of this kind of difference between Chinese and English is the numeral system. Thus, "兩百萬千瓦" is rendered as "2,000 megawatt". The latter could also be expressed in Chinese as "兩千兆瓦", but "兩百萬千瓦" (2,000,000 kilowatts) is more idiomatic in Chinese technical culture. There is even a character "瓩" meaning "kilowatts" in Chinese. Another example showing such differences is the way one refers to his or her home country. When the Chinese say *our country*, they take it for granted that it refers to China. When the language is changed to English for the English readers, *our country* should be changed to *China*. Accordingly, *Shandong* is known as one of the provinces in China for the Chinese, but this may not be clear to English-speaking people. Thus, *China* is added before the Shandong company's name so it corresponds with *US* eSolar.

In business transactions, the quantity clause is one of the necessary conditions for the conclusion of an import/export contract. The United

#### Translation Quarterly No. 64

Nations Convention on Contracts for International Sale of Goods requires that the quantity of goods delivered should be identical to that stipulated in the contract, or the buyer is entitled to reject the excessive portion of goods and make legal claims against the seller if the quantity is found to be less than that mentioned in the contract.

The units of calculation include weight, number, length, area, volume and capacity. The quantities of many commodities are calculated by weight: Gross Weight, Net Weight, Conditional Weight, Theoretical Weight, etc. Since quantity terms may be ambiguous, careful definitions in the sales contract are needed, and careful translation of these terms is important. The Metric System, the British System, the U.S. System and the International System of Units are generally used in international trade nowadays. In the context of China's foreign trade, the conversion of Chinese quantity terms into western and international ones poses a problem for translators in cultural adaptation.

The implementation and popularization of the *International System* of Units show the increasing internationalization and standardization of measurement systems. But confusion and misunderstanding in this regard are still not uncommon. An American pound, for instance, is different from a European pound. Similarly, a "ton" has different weights depending on whether it is a short ton, a metric ton, or a long ton, not to mention the conversion into Chinese measurement units such as *jin*  $(f\bar{r})$ , and *liang* ( $\bar{m}$ ).

Moreover, contractors are usually required to state clearly the quantities involved in the deal in a contract, and expressions like *about*, *approximately* should not be allowed. However, in practice, there is often a *More or Less Clause* in the contract. This is included because quite often the shipment is over-delivered or under-delivered, especially for bulk goods. The following example of a More or Less Clause can be used in contracts. Now, how should we translate a *More or Less Clause* into

Intercultural Awareness in Professional Translators

Chinese? Can the Chinese language express this idea in an efficient way? Those who know more about business cultures would say "yes". For example:

#### Example 2

The seller has the option of shipping 4% more or less on contracted quantity.

賣方裝貨時可在合同數量上有 4% 的溢短。

#### Example 3

Goods are packed in new gunny bags containing 100 kgs and each bag shall weight 1.15 kgs with an allowance of 0.1 kg more or less. 貨物用新麻袋裝運,每袋 100 公斤。每袋毛重應為 1.15 公斤,允 許 0.1 公斤溢短。

#### Example 4

1,000 metric tons, 5% more or less at seller's option. 共 1000 公噸, 允許賣方 5% 的溢短。

#### Example 5

The seller is allowed to delivery 5% more or less, the price will be calculated as per the unit price stipulated in the sales contract. 允許賣方在交貨時有 5% 的數量溢短,價格仍按銷售合同議定的單 價支付。

From these examples, we may conclude that the idiomatic way of rendering a *More or Less Clause* into Chinese could be "溢短裝條款". It sounds a little bit weird for laymen, but is quite professional in the context of Chinese business culture.

On the other hand, in non-technical translation, the importance

of cultural awareness tends to be more self-evident. The concept of translating across cultures plays a vital role in practice. In cross-cultural communication, each culture acts as a frame within which external signs or linguistic forms are interpreted. People who are part of different cultures do things differently because of different behaviour, rituals, values, and beliefs. These elements make up a cultural frame. A statement made in translation, even if grammatically and lexically correct, may still clash with the belief system or cultural viewpoint of target language readers. This is because of the clash of different cultural frames. Therefore, "cultural proficiency" is actually the translator's ability to understand different cultural frames and then adapt the translated text to the cultural frames of target readers.

One of the examples of such adaptation is shown by Shi Zhikang (2010), a translator from Shanghai International Studies University who translated for the Expo 2010 in Shanghai, China. In translating the *Programme of Entertaining Performances at the Expo Opening Ceremony*, he puts Chinese poetry into an English cultural frame.

#### Example 6

上有天堂,下有蘇杭。 *Literal translation*: Above there is heaven, below there is Suzhou and Hangzhou. *Shi's version*:

As there is a Celestial City, so there are such earthly paradises as Suzhou and Hangzhou.

This is an often-quoted Chinese saying that praises the remarkable scenery in *Suzhou* and *Hangzhou*, two East China cities that are wellknown for their heavenly beauty. The literal translation does not draw an analogy between heaven and the two cities. Shi (2010) notes that he Intercultural Awareness in Professional Translators

reproduces the cultural frame in English by borrowing a phrase from the British writer John Bunyan's (1628-1688) *The Pilgrim's Progress*: "... there were pilgrims walking to the Celestial City". Bunyan's alliterative "Celestial City" parallels "earthly paradises" and makes Shi's version appear smooth and natural in the target language culture. Let's look at some other examples.

#### Example 7

琵琶聲聲,輕彈柔唱,唱不盡的江南四季好風光。

Literal translation:

Playing *pipa* and soft singing could not well express the wonderful sight of the four seasons in the South of the Yangtze River.

Shi's version:

With the soft song accompanied by the melodious sound of the musical instrument *pipa*, we celebrate with infinite zest the charming four seasons in the South of the Yangtze River.

*Pipa* is a Chinese musical instrument well-known among the Chinese for its evocation of nostalgia, but it is not familiar to English-speaking people. It needs elaborating in translation. Shi (2010) says that the word *celebrate* comes from the American poet Walt Whitman's (1819-1892) opening line in *Song of Myself*: "I celebrate myself, and sing myself, ...". Here *celebrate* means "to honour or praise publicly". Through the poetic wording of "celebrate with infinite zest", the translator sets up a cultural frame for the English-speaking audience so they can experience what the Chinese readers feel when reading the original.

> **Example 8** 我們豐收了, 歡迎全世界的朋友一起來分享。 *Literal translation*:

We've got a bumper harvest, and we welcome our friends all over the world to share our happiness.

Shi's version:

We are blessed with the harvest, and we invite you, people all over the world, to share our happiness.

Here *be blessed (with sth.)* is a religious phrase that builds a Christian cultural frame for the English-speaking reader. Moreover, the sentence "we invite you, people (from) all over the world, to share our happiness" fits the tenor of the Expo Open Ceremony.

#### Example 9

唱吧,我們一起吟誦古老的故事。 Literal translation: Just sing, and we recite together an ancient story. Shi's version: Now let us sing an ode about an ancient story.

While the word *blessed* is religious, *ode* is a poetic word with Latin and Greek roots, meaning "to celebrate a special event". *To sing an ode* is the right expression to use here, reminding the audience of Romanticist English poems like *Ode to the West Wind* by Percy B. Shelley (1792-1822), and *Ode to a Nightingale* and *Ode on a Grecian Urn* by John Keats (1795-1821). One word is good enough to set up an entire cultural frame for the target language readers.

#### Example 10

微笑有情有愛的世界,世界有澀有甜的微笑,世界的微笑。 Literal translation:

Smile to a world with affection and love. The world has a smile that is

#### Intercultural Awareness in Professional Translators

sour and sweet, and this is the smile of the world.

Shi's version:

A smile, an emblem of the world full of love and affection. This is a world of sweets and sours, and we welcome this world with our smile.

In the literal translation, "a smile that is sour and sweet" is a bit awkward in English, though the original Chinese sounds quite natural. Does English have such an idea of a *smile*? Shi borrows a line from Edgar Allen Poe's (1809-1849) poem *Isrefel*. "this is world of sweets and sours", which contains the same image as the original.

#### Example 11

穿過記憶是誰?誰在歌唱?誰在歌唱?

Literal translation:

Who is going through the memory? Who is singing? Who is singing? *Shi's version*:

Emerging from the depths of memory, we are wondering: Who was singing? Who is singing?

The literal translation is correct in grammar and syntax, but somewhat vague in meaning. The process of "going through the memory" is implied in the context, and there should be some difference between the second and third sentences. Shi's rendering gives a good representation. By using the past and present tenses in "*was* singing" and "*is* singing", the translator gives readers a sense of the passage of time. While cherishing the "good old days", we celebrate the happiness of the present get-together.

From the above examples, we see that the importance of cultural awareness in translating can never be over-emphasised. The question is: To what extent do translators need to know about cross-cultural differences in the fields they are working? Not only are translators and interpreters expected to have a grasp of lexis and grammar, but they are also implicitly expected to understand the cultures for which they are translating.

At a technical level, communication is explicit, and ideas are consciously transmitted. Communication at this level has no extralinguistic context: the text is the authority, and the meaning is clearly spelled out. However, it is also at this level that the business community works, and the shortcomings of a translator and interpreter can be noticed. The successful interpreter and translator, at this level, will not only need to have a near-native command of both languages, but also must know where to find technical information efficiently—from concordances, dictionaries, encyclopaedias, glossaries and the internet. An interpreter who does not know much about the technical culture in question will certainly not be effective.

However, at a non-technical, or shall we say, at a general level, the negotiation of meaning is amplified. Now the meaning depends very much on the general culture in both source and target domains. Examples 6 through 11 above show that "general culture" covers a wide range of ideological and behavioural experiences. The organization of experience involves simplification and distortion, and it differs from culture to culture. Each culture has a frame within which external signs or "reality" are interpreted (Katan 1999: 3). Ideas can be comfortably accepted if they are presented within the cultural frame. Translation at this level is a kind of compromise between exotic alien experiences in the source language culture and the established frame in the target language culture. The degree of being more exotic or less so varies from translator to translator. The point is that a competent translator should develop a cultural awareness and maintain a good balance according to different contexts.

### References

Katan, David (1999). Translating Cultures: An Introduction for Translators, Interpreters and Mediators. Manchester: St Jerome.

- Newmark, Peter (1988). A Textbook of Translation. Hemel Hempstead: Prentice Hall.
- 史志康(2010),《美的追求——談世博會開幕式慶典文藝演出文本的翻 譯》,《東方翻譯》第4期。

### About the Author

Hong PING is currently Professor and Dean of the School of Interpreting and Translation Studies, Guangdong University of Foreign Studies in Guangzhou, China. He was educated in Wuhan University, China, and University College London (UCL), UK. He has been Secretary-General of China MTI Education Steering Committee, Member of China National Higher Education Examinations Board (Foreign Languages), and Inspector of the National Foreign Languages Teaching Steering Committee. He was rewarded one of The Best Peer Reviewers from the China National Planning Office for Research in Philosophy and Social Sciences in 2006 and 2008. His research interests are in Translation Studies and Intercultural Communication. He has contributed articles to such leading academic journals in China as Modern Foreign Languages, Foreign Languages, Chinese Translators Journal, Foreign Language in China, etc. His book English Idioms and Anglo-American Culture was published by the Foreign Language Teaching and Research Press in 2000 and reprinted in 2004. Another book, A Brief History of Linguistics, won the Best Academic Achievement Award from the Guangzhou Social Sciences Association in 2003.

# Annotation and Adaptation: A Case Study of a Chinese Translation of Joyce's *Ulysses*

# **Zhang Meifang**

## Abstract

James Joyce's Ulysses is considered by many scholars as one of the best English-language novels of the 20th century, and it has been translated into many other languages. However, it was not until 1994 that the first complete Chinese translation was published. Before Ulysses was translated into Chinese, very few Chinese readers had ever attempted to read it. This article discusses the Chinese translation by Xiao and Wen. By focusing on two of the translators' strategies—namely, annotation and adaptation—the paper examines how the translators turned this "unreadable" book into a readable one for ordinary Chinese readers, and discusses the role of literary translation in challenging or reinforcing cultural differences.

## Introduction

James Joyce's *Ulysses* is considered to be rich in literary techniques and insights into human nature, and at the same time it is widely seen as

a very difficult book. In fact, James Joyce himself once claimed: "I've put in so many enigmas and puzzles that it will keep the professors busy for centuries arguing over what I meant, and that's the only way of insuring one's Immortality". <sup>[1]</sup> This shows that Joyce's *Uhsses* was targeted at the academic reader and the difficulties were intentionally created by the author.

Before it was translated into Chinese, many Chinese readers even called *Ulysses* a *tianshu* (book from heaven), meaning it was too difficult to be understood by human beings. As a result, very few Chinese readers attempted to read the English version, and even fewer were interested in translating it into Chinese. Before the 1980s, although *Ulysses* had been translated into many other languages, no Chinese version came into being. In order to bring this great modernist work to the Chinese reader, Li Jingduan (李景端), the chief editor of the Nanjing Yilin Publishing House in China, invited Xiao Qian (蕭乾) and his wife Wen Jieruo (文潔若), two literary scholars and experienced translators, to undertake this formidable translation task. Li told the translators that although Joyce wrote the novel with the intention of making it difficult even for professors, the Chinese version should be targeted at ordinary Chinese readers.

Xiao Qian, one of the two translators, first read Joyce's books, including *Ulysses*, as early as 1930 when he was studying at Yanjing University (now Beijing University). In 1939, when he was studying literature in Britain, he again had a chance to read Joyce's works. In 1942 when he was studying at Cambridge University as a postgraduate student, he became interested in *Ulysses*. Although he was fascinated by the book, he was among the people who disapproved of Joyce's enigmas and puzzles for the reader. Xiao also recalled in the Foreword to the Chinese translation of *Ulysses* that when he was visiting the grave of James Joyce in Zurich in 1945, he thought: "Here lies the corpse of

someone who was a big traitor of the literary world. He used his talent and knowledge to explore a risky area, but at the same time wasted his great time and talent going into a blind alley" (Xiao and Wen 1994: 3). Forty-nine years later Xiao still thought that Joyce carried his virtuosity too far, and made the book "unnecessarily difficult".<sup>[2]</sup> He said: "This book is a miracle of literary creation in this century. ... However, it is not an example for Chinese writers to follow. China needs realistic novels that can reflect society and people's lives" (1994: 4). Therefore, when Li Jingduan first approached Xiao and his wife Wen Jieruo, inviting them to undertake the translation project, Xiao was not enthusiastic about it. But Wen was undaunted by the complexities; indeed, she was positively eager to have a crack at Joyce. Then sixty-two, and just retired from a career as a translator of Japanese literature and an editor of other people's translations, Wen felt it was time to put her skills to the test because in the past she had spent most of her time editing others' translations. Finally she persuaded her husband that they could manage it together. "I only promised to help them revise the translation. But somehow I got more and more deeply committed to the project", Xiao recalled in the Foreword to their translation of Ulysses. The project was based on teamwork from the beginning, with Wen doing the first draft, Xiao polishing it, and the two of them arguing over the final version.

As Xiao had feared, the translation proved to be filled with linguistic obstacles. Leopold Bloom's disorderly stream of consciousness throws up arcane vocabulary from 30-odd languages. "This is something that I still don't approve of. The author was deliberately making it difficult for the reader", said Xiao Qian to Teresa Poole in an interview in 1994. "For instance, the very last chapter [Molly Bloom's soliloquy], that naughty chapter, we've done it in colloquial Pekinese". <sup>[3]</sup>

During the translation process, the couple had to decipher Joyce's allusions by themselves in the first two years, then help came in 1992

when a friend sent them a copy of Don Gifford's *Ulysses Annotated: Notes for James Joyce's Ulysses.* The Irish embassy in Peking also stepped in with David Norris's illustrated *Joyce's Dublin* and a map of the city. <sup>[4]</sup> It took the two translators four years to complete the Chinese translation, which was published in 1994 and became a bestseller. The first edition of 85,000 copies of the three-volume translation were sold out; a second and a third edition were rushed into print. It is regarded by the commissioner as "a great success". <sup>[5]</sup> Some scholars noted that in rendering this "unreadable" book into a readable one for ordinary Chinese readers, Xiao and Wen's cooperation was the "most perfect and most harmonious of its kind" (Chen 1995: 14).

Translating this extraordinarily difficult book requires extraordinary courage and skill. As it is impossible in one article to cover all aspects of the translation, this article limits itself to discussing some of the annotations and adaptations the translators made, and the possible reasons for their choices. It will also discuss the role of literary translation in challenging or reinforcing cultural difference, as well as the role of translators in reporting on conflict caused by linguistic and cultural differences.

## Conflicts between Joyce's Enigmas and the Chinese Reader

Translating Joyce is no party game in any language, and translating it into Chinese is perhaps most difficult. To begin with, Chinese is ideographic, not alphabetic like English. The Chinese character "home" ( $\overline{x}$ , "jia"), for example, is represented by a stylized ideogram that has traditionally been interpreted to mean a pig beneath a roof. The English word "Ulysses" is not pictorial but aural, and comes alive when read

#### Translation Quarterly No. 64

aloud. As pointed out by Burelbach, Joyce often calls our attention to the "basically artificial, arbitrary process of naming" <sup>[6]</sup> and he cites as an illustration the Sinbad the Sailor passage from *Uhysses*:

Example (1) He rests. He has travelled. With? Sinbad the Sailor and Tit

Sinbad the Sailor and Tinbad the Tailor and Jinbad the Jailer and Whinbad the Whaler and Ninbad the Nailer and Finbad the Failer and Binbad the Bailer and Pinbad the Pailer and Minbad the Mailer and Hinbad the Hailer and Rinbad the Railer and Dinbad the Kailer and Vinbad the Quailer and Linbad the Yailer and Xinbad the Phthailer. (U 659)

Perhaps Joyce simply plays with names alphabetically in the above quoted paragraph, but it would create a lot of difficulty for the Chinese translator, because Chinese is not an alphabetical language. To make things more difficult, Chinese is a tonal language. In Putonghua, China's official national language, there are four tones to each sound. For example, the vowel "a" has a level tone, a rising tone, a falling rising tone, and a falling tone. The tones make a difference to the meaning of words when uttered. Consider using the word "jia" with different tones in different contexts: "wodejia" (我的家, my home)—here "jia" has the level tone, meaning "home"; "tadejia" (她的頰, her face)— "jia" with the rising tone can refer to one's face; "zheshijiade" (這是假的, this is false)— "jia" with the falling and rising tones can mean "false"; and "tadejia" (它的價錢, its price)— "jia" with the falling tone means "price". With such huge differences between English and Chinese pronunciations, we can imagine how much difficulty the translator has in the process of translating proper names from English to Chinese.

The book title *Uhsses* is transliterated by Xiao and Wen as "尤利 西斯" (you li xi si), a proper name with sounds similar to the original. But proper names are not always translated syllable for syllable in the book. For example, "Sinbad the Sailor" is translated as *shuishou xinboda* (水手辛伯達), "Tinbad the Tailor" as *caifeng tingboda* (裁縫廷伯達), "Jailer and Whinbad" as *yuzu jinboda* (獄卒金伯達), etc. These examples show that when words with semantic meanings such as "sailor", "tailor", and "jailer" are translated, the sound effects intentionally created by Joyce are lost in translation.

But the play with names is not the most difficult part for the Chinese translators; most difficult is perhaps the intertextuality in Ulysses, which is linked to many other literary works. For example, it alludes to the hero of Homer's Odyssey (Latinized as Ulysses), and there are many parallels, both implicit and explicit, between the two works; for example, there are the correspondences between Leopold Bloom and Odysseus, Molly Bloom and Penelope, and Stephen Dedalus and Telemachus. There are also intertextual allusions to many other literary works, such as the works of Plato, Aristotle, Dante, Shakespeare and Milton, and the Bible. Furthermore, challenges for the translator also arise from the novel's stream of consciousness technique and highly experimental prose, for example, the puns, allusions, rich characterizations and broad humour. Many puns are homonyms making use of the similar spellings or pronunciations between English and other related languages. English and many languages at least share the Roman alphabet, and therefore a common corpus of sounds, but in Chinese, things are completely different.

## The Translators' Translation Strategies

On the writing of Ulysses, Joyce said,

It is the epic of two races (Israel-Ireland) and at the same time the cycle of the human body as well as a little story of a day (life) ... It is also a kind of encyclopaedia. My intention is not only to render the myth *sub specie temporis nostri* and also to allow each adventure (that is, every hour, every organ, every art being interconnected and interrelated in the somatic scheme of the whole) to condition and even to create its own technique. (James Joyce, *Letters*, 21st September 1920)

In order to help the ordinary Chinese reader understand Joyce's intention that was realized in the wording and content of *Ulysses*, Xiao and Wen resorted to many different methods in translation, but this article focuses on *annotation and adaptation*, perhaps the most outstanding strategies used in this translation.

#### Bringing Ulysses to the Reader through Annotations

Xiao and Wen's translation of *Uhsses* has an overwhelming number of footnotes—nearly 6,000. During the translation process, the two translators used many reference books, including annotations made by western scholars like Gifford's *James Joyce's Uhsses* (1974; 1988). Although Xiao and Wen share Gifford's intention of providing "a specialized encyclopedia that will inform a reading of *Uhsses*" (1988: xv), their annotated items seem to be different. For Gifford, "the rule of thumb I have followed is to annotate all the items not available in standard desk dictionaries", and for Xiao and Wen, proper names and puns that carry culture specific information and connotations are key items to be annotated.

Xiao explained in the Foreword to the Chinese translation of Ulysses (1995: 17) that he himself did not favour adding notes to a literary work because he considered it an interruption to the reading. However, when translating Joyce's Ulysses, he had no choice but to break his own principle because the purpose of the translation was different from that of the original work. Joyce intentionally made the book difficult so as to keep the professors busy, whereas Nanjing Yilin Publishing advised Xiao and Wen to come up with a readable version of Uhsses for ordinary Chinese readers. Therefore, "with contradictory attitudes", they decided to use annotation as one of the strategies to crack Joyce's puzzles and enigmas. According to Xiao's Foreword, they followed two main principles in the practice of annotation: (1) the annotations should help ordinary educated readers understand the novel and serve as a useful reference tool for researchers, and (2) the annotations should help readers better understand proper names related specifically to cultural items. Examples in the following section illustrate this point.

All English examples for this study come from the 1960 edition published by Bodley Head Penguin Books, Paris, and the Chinese translation examples are from Xiao and Wen's translation published by Yilin Publishing in 1994. The source text is indicated with U+page number (e.g., U154), and the Chinese translation, with T+page number (e.g., T283). Back translations of the annotations (mainly literal translations) are given, and in some cases, transliterations are also given by the present author.

Example (2)

ST: Our great day, she said. Feast of Our Lady of Mount Carmel. Sweet name too: caramel. (U154)

TT: 她說:這是我們的大日子, 迦密山 [45] 的聖母節, 名字也挺 甜:像糖蜜 [46]。(T283) Footnotes: [45] 迦密山是以色列西北部一道山嶺。在《聖經》中, 為先知以利亞與崇拜巴力神的眾先知對證真偽之處。這裏也是迦爾 默羅會的發源地(約1156年)。[46] 這是文字遊戲。迦密的原文 作 Carmel,而糖蜜的原文是 caramel,這兩個詞發音相近。(1994: 324)

**Back translation of the footnotes:** [45] Mount Carmel is a mountain located in northwestern Israel. In the Bible, it was where Elijah and the prophets of Baal conducted a test of the powers of Baal and the God of Israel. It was also the place where the Carmelite Order was founded (around the year 1156). [46] This is wordplay. The mountain name "Carmel" and the word "caramel" are similar in pronunciation.

Example (2) is taken from the part in which the protagonist Leopold Bloom indulges in his daydreams. Bloom is a Jewish advertising salesman full of fantasies and desires. He likes to eat mutton kidneys with the smell of urine; he fantasizes when he sees naked statues of goddesses in the museum. In this example, Bloom imagines a beautiful nun is talking to him, and she mentions Mount Carmel, which sounds like "caramel" to him. Mount Carmel is a proper name, and it can be translated into Chinese according to its sound 迦密山 (jiamishan). Caramel is a kind of honey, which can be translated as 糖蜜 (tangmi) in Chinese. The reason for the association of the two words in Ulysses is that the two words have similar sounds; however, when translated into Chinese, their pronunciations are completely different. As a result, the original effect of the wordplay is lost in translation. Without any explanation, readers may feel puzzled as to why the two irrelevant concepts were conjoined by Joyce. In order to help the Chinese reader better understand Joyce's intention, the translators offer explanations in the annotation. They first introduce the geographical location of "Mount Carmel", then provide information about its historical significance in

relation to the Bible, and at the same time they decode the wordplay involving "Carmel" and "caramel".

Example (3) ST: God made food, the devil the cooks. Devilled crab. (U171) TT: 天主創造了食物,魔鬼製造了廚子 [216]。辣子螃蟹 [217]。 (T305)

**Annotations:** [216] 套用英國作家約翰•泰勒 (1580-1653) 的話。 原為: "天主送來了食物,魔鬼送來了廚子"(《約翰•泰勒全 集》)。[217] 這是文字遊戲。原文裏,魔鬼是 devil,而辣子螃蟹 則是 devilled crab; devil 與 devilled 讀音相近。(T333)

**Back translation of the annotations:** [216] Quotation from the British poet John Taylor (1580-1653). The original sentence is "God sent food, the devil the cooks" (from *Complete Works of John Taylor*). [217] This is wordplay. "Devil" puns with "devilled"; they share similar sounds.

The source text of Example (3) contains three simple clauses: "God made food, the devil the cooks. Devilled crab". When it is read aloud in English, the auditory connection between "devil" and "devilled" will be understood, but when translated into Chinese, "devil" becomes 魔鬼 (mogui), and "devilled" becomes 辣子 (lazi). The two words sound completely different. In order not to leave the reader confused, the translators added two footnotes, the first of which provides information about the source of the quotation "God made food, the devil the cooks", and the second explains why "Devil" and "devilled" are put together. Example (3) also shows that, in Xiao and Wen's translation, an annotation can be longer than the original text.

Apart from footnotes on proper names or culture specific terms in the Chinese translation of *Ubssess*, "echoing notes" (呼應注) are also used throughout the book. Echoing notes are footnotes that remind the reader of other footnotes appearing in earlier or later chapters. The following are several cases in point.

Example (4)

ST: -Is the brother with you, Malachi?

-Down in Westmeath. With the Bannons.

---Still there? I got a card from Bannon. Says he found a sweet young thing down there. Photo girl he calls her. (U28)

TT: "弟弟跟你在一起嗎,瑪拉基?"

"他在韋斯特米恩,跟班農 [123] 一家人在一起。"

"還在那兒嗎?班農給我寄來一張明信片說他在那兒遇見了一個可愛的小妞兒。他管她叫昭相姑娘 [124]。" (T51)

Annotations: [123] 韋斯特米恩位於都柏林市以西四十英里處,是 愛爾蘭倫斯特省一郡。亞歷克•班農是個學生。參看第四章中米莉 來信和第十四章注 [146] 及有關正文。[124] 指本書另一主人公利奧 波德•布盧姆的女兒米莉。她在韋斯特米恩郡穆林加爾市的照相館 工作。該市距都柏林五十英里。

**Back translation of the annotations:** [123] Westmeath, located 40 miles west of Dublin, is a county in Leinster Province, Ireland. Alec Bannon is a student. Please refer to the correspondence from Milly in Chapter 4 and annotation [146] in Chapter 14, as well as related texts. [124] (Photo girl) refers to another protagonist, Leopold Bloom's daughter Milly. She works in a photo studio in Mullingar, Westmeath. Mullingar is 50 miles away from Dublin.

Example (5)

ST: Dearest Papli,

Thanks ever so much for the lovely birthday present. ... I am getting on swimming in the photo business now ... There is a young student comes here some evenings named Bannon his cousins or something are big swells ... Your fond daughter, Milly (U68) TT: 最親愛的爹爹:

非常非常謝謝您這漂亮的生日禮物。……照相這一行現在我越幹越 順當。……有個姓班農的年輕學生,有時傍晚到這兒來。他的堂兄 弟還是個什麼大名人……米莉 (T131)

Example (6)

ST: Our worthy acquaintance, Mr Malachi Mulligan, now appeared in the doorway as the students were finishing their apologue accompanied by a friend whom he had just reencountered, a young gentleman, his name Alec Bannon, who had late come to town ... (U399) ... The young gentleman, his friend, overjoyed as he was at a passage that had befallen him, could not forbear to tell it his nearest neighbor. (U400) TT: 學生們之寓言行將結束,吾等畏友瑪拉基 • 穆利根先生偕初邂 逅之友出現於門口,係一青年紳士,名亞歷克 • 班農 [146] 也。(I701) ……其友,一年輕紳士,對新近之艷遇 [159] 喜不自勝,不 禁告知鄰座。(I702)

Annotations: [146] 班農,見第四章中米莉致布盧姆信。[159] 指班 農與布盧姆的女兒米莉交往事,見第一章注 [124]。

**Back translation of the annotations:** [146] For more about Bannon, please refer to Milly's correspondence with Leopold Bloom in Chapter 4. [159] (Overjoyed at ...) This refers to the relationship between Bannon and Milly. See annotation [124] in Chapter 1.

Example (4) is taken from page 28 in Chapter 1; Example (5), from page 68 in Chapter 4; and Example (6), from page 399 in Chapter 14. They are located far apart from each other in *Ulysses* but connected implicitly or explicitly by two characters: Bannon and Milly. In the last part of Chapter 1, Mulligan mentions "Bannon" and the lovely "photo

girl" for the first time; in Chapter 4, from the letter Milly writes to her father the reader understands that she is the "photo girl" and Bannon goes to see her from time to time in late afternoons. In Chapter 14 Bannon shows up again, the clause "overjoyed as he was at a passage that had befallen him through" implicitly reveals the secret affair between Bannon and the "photo girl" Milly. Since the name "Bannon" is mentioned in all the above quoted passages, there should not be any big problem for the reader. However, for the words or phrases related to Milly, readers must have a very good memory and knowledge in order to connect the various pieces of information—such as "a sweet young thing", "photo girl", "your fond daughter" and "Milly" —to the same person. So the echoing footnotes are indeed helpful for the reader.

#### Bringing Ulysses to the Reader through Adaptation

According to Xiao, the two translators tried very hard to "transform the difficult book into a fluent and readable one for the Chinese reader" (1994: Foreword). In order to achieve this aim, they often used adaptive methods in their translation.

Example (7) ST: Davy Byrne smiledyawnednodded all in one: —Iiiiiichaaaaaaach! (U177) TT: 戴維•伯恩邊微笑邊打哈欠邊點頭。"啊——哧!"(T313) Back translation of the TT: Davy Byrne was smiling yawning and nodding. Aaaaaaaaach!

In the ST of Example (7), the compound word "smiledyawnednodded" was created by Joyce with three verbs put together, i.e. "smiled", "yawned" and "nodded". It may well reflect the author's intention to show the simultaneity of the three actions, or to create some difficulties

for the reader. Nevertheless, if this compound word is literally translated into Chinese, as "戴維•伯恩微笑打哈欠點頭", the sentence would not meet Chinese grammatical rules. Therefore, the translators use three adverbs "邊" (bian) in front of the verbs to express the simultaneous progression of the three actions: 邊微笑 (bianweixiao = smiling), 邊打 哈欠 (bian da ha qian = yawning) 邊點頭 (biandiantou = nodding). By using the adaptive methods of addition and separation—i.e. by adding the Chinese adverb "邊" (bian) before each verb—the compound word "smiledyawnednodded" can be easily understood as showing three separate but simultaneous actions.

Example (8) is a translation of a poem, where Xiao and Wen adapted the acrostic form in order to keep the meaning of the original.

Example (8)

ST: Poets oft have sung in rhyme

Of music sweet their praise divine.

Let them hymn it nine times nine.

Dearer far than song or wine,

You are mine. The world is mine. (U599)

#### TT: (T1047)

詩人頻用韻文寫, (shi ren pin yong yun wen xie)
神妙贊歌聖音樂, (shen miao zan ge sheng yin yue)
九九八十一重疊, (jiu jiu ba shi yi chong die)
勝似詩酒情切切, (sheng si shi jiu qing qie qie)
咸屬我卿與世界。(xian shu wo qing yu shi jie)

#### Back Translation of the TT:

Poets often use rhyme to write,

Wonderful paean and sacred music,

Hymning nine times nine,

Dearer than song or wine,

Translation Quarterly No. 64

You and the world belong to me.

The original poem in Example (8) reflects Bloom's most ambitious literary effort, made while courting Molly. It is an acrostic poem bearing his pet name: POLDY (LEOPOLD). The acrostic poem is also a form found in Chinese poetry; however, owing to the great differences in pronunciation and spelling between the two languages, an acrostic English poem may not be translatable into Chinese. Xiao and Wen produce a translation that is semantically equivalent to the original, as indicated in the Back Translation. However, the poet's pet name POLDY, which is intentionally incorporated by Joyce into the headwords of the five lines, is lost in the translation.

Apart from the two above-mentioned examples, adaptation is found in many other places in Xiao and Wen's Chinese translation of *Ulysses*. For example, in the original text James Joyce inserts dashes at the beginning of lines to mark the turns of conversation, as indicated in Example (4):

—Is the brother with you, Malachi?—Down in Westmeath. With the Bannons.

In the Chinese version, Xiao and Wen do not follow this practice; instead, they use conventional quotation marks to indicate the turns of conversation so as to comply with the Chinese reader's expectations:

> "弟弟跟你在一起嗎,瑪拉基?" "他在韋斯特米恩,跟班農 [123] 一家人在一起。"

The most obvious adaptation is perhaps that in the last chapter, where the original is the most typical example of Joyce's stream of consciousness experiment. The chapter enters the mind of Bloom's wife, Molly, presenting her thoughts in 24,195 words with only one punctuation mark, a period at the end of the chapter. After Bloom goes to bed, Molly remains awake and reflects on her younger days. Her thoughts go from love, food, wine and sex to other married couples, including a husband going to bed with his boots on. She also recalls the days when she met Leopold. The passage that ends the novel with her acceptance of her husband is as follows:

#### Example (9)

ST: yes when I put the rose in my hair like the Andalusian girls used or shall I wear a red yes and how he kissed me under the Moorish wall and I thought well as well him as another and then I asked him with my eyes to ask again yes and then he asked me would I yes to say yes my mountain flower and first I put my arms around him yes and drew him down to me so he could feel my breasts all perfume yes and his heart was going like mad and yes I said yes I will Yes.

TT: 對啦 當時我在頭髮上插了朵玫瑰 像安達盧西亞姑娘們常做 的那樣 要麼我就還是戴朵紅玫瑰吧 好吧 在摩爾牆腳下 他曾 咋樣地親我呀 於是我想 喏 他也不比旁的人差呀 於是我遞個 眼色教他再向我求一回 於是他間我願意嗎 對啦 說聲好吧 我 的山花 於是我先伸出胳膊摟住他 對啦 並且把他往下拽 讓他 這樣他就能感觸到我那對香氣襲人的乳房啦 對啦 他 堅貼着我 如醉如狂 於是我說 好吧 那顆心啊 我願意 好吧。

**Back translation of the TT:** yes when I put the rose in my hair like the Andalusian girls used or shall I wear a red yes and how he kissed me under the Moorish wall and I thought well as well him as another and then I asked him with my eyes to ask again yes and then he asked me would I yes to say yes my mountain flower and first I put my arms around him yes and drew him down to me so he could feel my breasts all perfume yes and his heart was going like

47

Translation Quarterly No. 64

mad and yes I said yes I will Yes.

We can see from Example (9) that there is no punctuation in the source text, but in the translated text, a space is left between sentences. Normally in English writing, there is a space between words and a punctuation mark between sentences, but in Chinese writing there is no space between characters if they belong to one sentence, although the punctuation rules are very much the same as those in English. However, many Chinese characters have different meanings when grouped with different characters. If the last chapter is literally translated into a nonpunctuated text without intervening spacing, it would cause even greater difficulties for the Chinese reader. Therefore Xiao and Wen separated the "sentences" by leaving a space between them.

## **Discussion: To Report or to Adapt?**

When discussing literary translation research models, Lambert (1998: 131) maintains that "translation is a culture-bound phenomenon" and "it is essential that we study the way in which it varies through time and across cultures, as well as reasons for this variation". This article indeed aims to study the cross-cultural variations between Joyce's *Ufysses* and Xiao and Wen's Chinese translation, and to suggest reasons for the variations. In the previous section, we have analyzed eight examples taken from Xiao and Wen's Chinese translation, focusing on their two translation strategies: *annotation* and *adaptation*. In this section we will borrow Nord's functionalist theory to discuss the role of literary translation, and to explore possible factors behind the translators' adopted practice.

Based on the theory of translational action, Nord considers literary

translation as intercultural communication, the actional aspects of which include "the sender or author, intention, receivers, medium, place, time and motive, the message, effect or function" (1997: 80-82). Although some scholars maintain that literary works may not have a communicative purpose, we are told by James Joyce himself that Ulysses was written with certain intentions. The overriding ones are to keep the professors busy for centuries arguing over what he meant, and that is "the only way of insuring one's Immortality", while the specific intentions are to create "the epic of two races (Israel-Ireland) and at the same time the cycle of the human body as well as a little story of a day", and "to render the myth sub specie temporis nostri and also to allow each adventure ... to condition and even to create its own technique" (as quoted above). The overriding intentions indicate that his targeted receivers are professors or academics, and his wish to insure his immortality, to create an epic of two races and a new literary technique, can also be understood as the message he wanted to send to the reader.

Compared with those of the source text, the actional aspects of the Chinese translation are very different. The *sender* of *Ulysses* in Chinese is Yilin Publishing, whose *intention* is "to bring this great modern work to the ordinary Chinese reader" (*receiver*), and the *medium* of the Chinese version is of course the Chinese language rather than English. The Chinese translation was published in China in the 1990s, over seventy years after *Ulysses* first came into being, so it was obvious that the *messages* sent by Joyce via this novel had become even more unfamiliar to the Chinese reader of this *time*. As Xiao Qian points out in the Foreword, "James Joyce purposefully put in so many enigmas and puzzles in the novel, so we cannot but take measures to crack them so as to meet the expectations of our readers". Annotation and adaptation are two of their methods of dealing with the enigmas and puzzles. The use of former implies that the source text elements are more or less faithfully

translated but need further explanations in order to be understood by the target readers, as indicated by Examples (1)-(5) above, while the use of the latter means that some of the source text elements have been changed or replaced by target language elements, as indicated in Examples (7)-(9). But why do the translators sometimes use annotation, and sometimes adaptation? Perhaps what Chen Shu says in his Guide to Reading Ulysses can provide an answer to these questions. Chen, a professor at Beijing Foreign Studies University and an expert in English literature, was invited by the Yilin Publishing House to write some guidelines to reading Uhysses. He points out in his book that "in the translation process Xiao and Wen tried to produce a translation faithful to the original, but at the same time when they could not find any equivalents in the target language, they used adaptive methods to make the book readable (1995: 14-15). Indeed, constrained by the translators' ideal principle of faithfulness and by the great linguistic differences between the two languages, the Chinese version of Ulysses blends literal (faithful) with free (unfaithful) translation.

Like other translation methods, annotation and adaptation have their limitations. While annotations interfere with the reading, adaptations surely lead to the loss of some original features in the translation. Example (8) is a case in point. When Xiao and Wen adapt the poem into Chinese, the acrostic form intentionally deployed by Joyce is lost in the translation. It is not our intention in this paper to do any comparison of Xiao and Wen's translation with the other Chinese translation of *Ulysses* by Jin Di, but it might be helpful at this point to bring in Jin's opinion about preserving the characteristics of the acrostic poem. For Jin, the most important features of Joyce's original poem under discussion are: (a) the acrostic form, with the first letters of the lines forming the word "Poldy", (b) the rhyming of every line, (c) the singer professing incomparable passion for the receptor, and (d) the singer's great pride in having won over the receptor (Jin 2003: 110-111). For him, the two formal features are as important as the content features. Example (10) is Jin's translation:

> Example (10) (Translated by Jin Di) 利用格律加韻腳, (Li yong ge lu jia yun jiao,) 奧妙詩歌無盡了, (ao miao shi ge wu jin liao,) 波濤翻滾逐浪高, (bo tao fan gun zhu lang gao,) 爾後唯有我詩好, (er hou wei you wo shi hao,) 得你就是獨佔鰲。(de ni jiu shi du zhan ao.) Back translation: (by Jin Di) In rhythmical verse with rhyme, Wonderful songs are sung without end, Like tidal waves rolling higher and higher, But mine will be the only song worth singing, For you are mine. I am the top of the world.

In Jin's translation, the name LEOPOLD (利奧波爾得 Li ao bo er de) is embedded in the initial characters in the five lines, which is intended to preserve the original flavour. However, as pointed out by Jin himself, although the characteristic of the acrostic has been retained, "some of the facts" have been "completely transformed" (2003: 110-111). The transformed lines, especially the third one, "Like tidal waves rolling higher and higher", may sound very strange to the Chinese reader because they are irrelevant. The translator put the lexical item "波濤" (waves) at the beginning of the line in order to place the third character of the Chinese name there. Because of the meaning of "波" (tides) or "波濤" (waves), the whole line goes astray. The same can be said of the fourth and the fifth lines.

# Conclusion

Having analysed and discussed some examples of Xiao and Wen's translation of James Joyce's *Ulysses*, we now come to our conclusion. Over centuries of literary translation, the translator has been expected to transfer not only the content of the source text but also the form and style, so as to achieve equivalence between source and target texts. Yet in reality this ideal is hard to achieve. As our discussion shows, there are at least three factors that may prevent the realization of equivalence in translation: first, the purpose of the translation; second, the understanding of readers' expectations; and third, the cultural differences between the source and target languages. With all these constraints, the translator has to use all kinds of strategies to represent what the original author intends to convey in the source text and, at the same time, ease the linguistic conflicts which reflect the differences between the two cultures.

#### Notes

- [1] Quoted from the "Introduction" of Jeri Johnson (see Joyce 1922/1998:6).
- <sup>[2]</sup> Quoted from Li Jingduan, "The Translation of *Ulysses* and Me", in *Guangming Daily*, 06/11/2008.
- [3] Quoted from Teresa Poole, "Happy Ending to Long Struggle for Words: China's Translator of James Joyce Counts Casualties of a Literary Life", a report for *The Independent*, November 20, 1994.
- <sup>[4]</sup> Ibid.
- <sup>[5]</sup> According to Li Jingduan (from the same source as footnote [2]), up to 2008 the total number of copies of *Ulysses* published by Yilin Publishing was over 180,000. The Publishing Company won two national prizes for

#### Annotation and Adaptation

its publication of Ulysses.

<sup>[6]</sup> Quoted in Culleton (1994: 101).

#### References

- Chen, Shu (1995). Guide To Reading Ulysses. Taipei: Shibao Publishing [陳恕, 《尤利西斯導讀》, 台北:時報出版].
- Culleton, Claire (1994). *Names and Naming in Joyce*. Wisconsin: The University of Wisconsin Press.
- Gifford, Don (1974/1988). Ulysses Annotated: Notes for James Joyce's Ulysses. Berkeley, Los Angeles and London: University of California Press.
- Jin, Di (2003). Literary Translation: Quest for Artistic Integrity. Manchester: St. Jerome Publishing.

Joyce, James (1960). Ulysses. Paris: The Bodley Head Penguin Books.

\_\_\_\_ (1922/1998). Ulysses. Oxford: Oxford University Press (with an "Introduction" by Jeri Johnson).

- Xiao, Qian, and Wen Jieruo, trans. (1994). Uhsses. Nanjing: Yilin Publishing 「蕭乾、文潔若,《尤利西斯》,南京:譯林出版社].
- Zhang, Meifang (2001). "Textual Intentionality and Translation Strategies". In *Journal of Foreign Languages* 2: 37-41 [張美芳, 〈意圖與語篇製作的策略〉, 《外國語》2001 年第二期,頁 37-41].

#### About the Author

Prof. Zhang Meifang joined the University of Macau in 2003 and holds a full professorship. She was previously Professor of English and Translation in the School of Foreign Languages of Sun Yat-sen University, Guangzhou, where she also served as Head of the English Department. She received her PhD degree (specializing in Translation Studies) from Hong Kong Baptist University in 1999, and currently she is Subject Leader of Translation and Coordinator of the Master of Arts in Translation Studies at the University of Macau. She is Vice President of the Macau Federation of Translators and Interpreters. Her recent research focus has been upon media translation from functional perspectives, which has included work on the translation of public notices, news reports and advertisements. She is supervising PhD theses in the areas of (a) media discourse and the translation studies; (c) text typology and translation strategies; (d) translation teaching and translation assessment, and (e) corpus-based translation research.

# Taken Out of Context: The Importance of Context in Japanese-into-English Translation

James L. Davis

## Abstract

Since Japanese is a high-context language, the translator must identify and make use of all potential sources of information within a text that can clarify which among several possible interpretations of a word or phrase is the one intended by the author. This paper includes numerous examples to illustrate how context provides essential information that can assist the Japaneseinto-English translator in producing a translation that is complete, accurate, and natural-sounding.

# Introduction

Japanese is a high-context language. Among other consequences of this fact we find that in a Japanese document the context in which a statement is made exerts particularly strong influence over the way information is presented. Viewed from the opposite point of view, the type of information that is included in—or is omitted from—a particular Japanese sentence is heavily dependent upon the context in which that sentence appears. Thus, the translator must identify and make use of all potential sources of information within a text that can clarify which among several possible interpretations of a word or phrase is the one intended by the author. Context plays a role not only when multiple meanings exist for an individual word or a phrase, but also when topics or subjects are omitted, when antecedents are not clearly specified, and when idiomatic references are made. The latter point is particularly relevant when linguistic borrowing takes place and idiomatic expressions from English or other languages are rendered in Japanese.

In this paper I will present several specific examples to illustrate how context provides essential information that can assist the Japaneseinto-English translator in producing a translation that is complete, accurate, and natural sounding. All of the Japanese example sentences appeared in books or technical papers that were used in Japanese courses that are offered at the University of Wisconsin-Madison. A sentence translation within quotation marks was prepared by a student in one of those courses; a sentence translation that is surrounded by asterisks (\*\*\*) is my own.

# Example 1: Use of a Noun for a Figurative, rather than Literal, Meaning

The following sentence appeared in a Wikipedia article on the Internet:

## 渡す側の理由としては、「"*袖の下*"を渡すと医者の態度が全然 違う」が一番多い。(1)

The character 袖 means "sleeve", so the literal meaning of the phrase

袖の下 would be "under the sleeve" or "beneath the sleeve". However, the use of quotation marks in the sentence suggests that a literal meaning is not intended. It is clear that the writer is using a figure of speech. The verb 渡す means "to deliver", "to hand over", or "to provide (someone with money)". In this particular sentence the phrase 袖の下 functions as the direct object of this verb. From the context we may conclude that 袖の下 actually refers to a bribe or money that is handed from one person to another "under the table". The Japanese phrase 袖の下 conveys the image of someone hiding something in the sleeve of a kimono or perhaps letting the kimono sleeve fall onto an envelope of cash that was conveniently left on a table. This Japanese phrase and the English expression "under the table" both suggest a desire to hide some action from the view of others.

The character 袖 also appeared in the following passage from a newspaper article that was published by the 日本経済新聞 several years ago:

民主党の鳩山由紀夫幹事長は 12 日、福島市内で街頭演説し、 米国による北朝鮮のテロ支援国家指定解除について「1 年に 2 度も首相が代わるから、日米同盟を命のように思っていて も米国から*袖にされる*。(2)

In this instance 袖 becomes part of the expression 袖にされる, which is simply the passive equivalent of 袖にする. A literal interpretation of 袖にされる would be "is given the sleeve", but this clearly does not make sense. From the context we can determine that Japan is "suffering" from this action by the United States. In fact, 袖にされる is an idiomatic expression that means "is ignored", "is taken lightly", "is not appreciated", "is given the brush-off", or "is given the cold shoulder". Any one of these meanings would be valid in this particular context. The close physical proximity between "sleeve" and "shoulder" suggests that the Japanese and English expressions may have a common link through the gesture of turning one's back on someone who is not liked or is not respected, but this is pure conjecture.

# **Example 2: Familiar Words** in an Unfamiliar Context

In a book that describes some of the problems confronting the Japanese economy the author writes the following sentence:

七〇〜八〇年代は二度の石油ショックを経て安定成長期に入り、成長率は*三%台後半*に低下した。さらに、九〇年代初頭のバブル崩壊後はさらに**低下、一%**台前半で推移した。(3)

Two students offered the following translations:

During the 1970s and 80s, Japan experienced two oil crises and entered a period of stable growth, with growth rates slowing to *a high three percentage points*. The growth rate fell further in the early 1990s, following the collapse of the Bubble, hovering at rates *below a half a percent*.

In the period from 1970 to 1980, after passing through two oil crises a period of stable growth was entered. The growth rate then declined to *a level of 3% in the latter half of this period*. In addition, in the beginning of the 1990s there was an additional decline after the collapse of the Bubble, changing to a level *of 1% within the first half of that decade*. The words 前半 and 後半 are widely used to convey the meanings "first half" and "second half", respectively, for an interval of time, a game, or a battle. However, in this instance each term follows the character 台, which in turn follows a percentage value. The character 台 literally refers to a pedestal, a platform, a stand, or some object for supporting other items. When the same character follows a numerical value, it usually refers to a "level" or a "mark" on a numerical scale. Based on this information we may conclude that the expression 三%台 後半 refers to the "second half" of an interval that lies above the "three percent level". The most logical choice for this interval would be the interval between 3.0% and 4.0%.

Using similar reasoning we may assume that the expression -%台前半 represents the "first half" of an interval that lies above the "one percent level". The most logical choice for this interval would be the interval between 1.0% and 2.0%. The first student recognized the percentage values but did not understand the relationship between 後 半 or 前半 and the stated percentage. The second student also recognized the percentage values but assumed that 後半 and 前半 referred to an interval of time, even though there is no explicit reference to a time interval in either phrase. In this example the key point for the translator is to recognize that the "interval" in question is a percentage increment. With this thought in mind we understand that the phrase 三%台後半 refers to "the 3.5-3.9% range", and the phrase —%台前半 represents "the 1.0-1.4% range".

## **Example 3: Making it Real**

The word 実現 is fundamentally associated with the process of converting an abstract entity (such as an idea or a concept) into a concrete

entity (such as an object or a numerical result). Authoritative dictionaries offer meanings such as "realization", "attainment", "actualization", "materialization", and "fruition", but the inherently broad range of application for this word forces the translator to select a translation that fits the specific context in which the word appears. In a technical paper that describes different types of glass we encounter the following sentence:

## 図 1 に太陽光エネルギー波長分布と、上記光学特性を*実現す* る材料の候補としての、銅イオンを有する合わせガラスを透 過したエネルギー分布を示した。(4)

In this instance the direct object of the verb 実現する is 光学特性, which means "optical characteristics". A student submitted the following translation:

Figure 1 displays the sunlight energy wavelength distribution. Also displayed is the transmitted energy distribution of a glass laminate containing copper ions, as a candidate material that can *actualize* the optical characteristics mentioned above.

This student translated 実現する as "actualize". The verb "actualize" is a valid word, but the combination of "actualize" and "optical characteristics" sounds more like marketing jargon than the objective of an R&D project. A newly developed material would be expected to "display", "exhibit", or "provide" a desired property. Thus, the sentence could be translated like this:

> \*\*\* Fig. 1 shows the energy vs. wavelength distribution for sunlight and the comparable distribution for the light that is transmitted by

laminated glass containing copper ions. Such a glass is one candidate/ option/possibility as a material that **displays/exhibits/provides** the above-mentioned optical characteristics. \*\*\*

In a technical paper that describes a new type of LED we find this sentence:

半導体の中で最も短い波長で発光することが理論的に予測さ れていた窒化アルミニウム (AIN) を用いた発光ダイオード (LED) の動作を*実現し、*波長 210 nm の遠紫外光を観測する ことに<u>成功した</u>。(5)

Here the direct object of 実現し is 動作, which could mean something along the lines of "action", "movement", "demeanor", or "operation". A student proposed this translation:

Luminescence of the shortest wavelength among semiconductors has been *implemented* through the action of a light emitting diode (LED) which uses aluminum nitride and which followed theoretical predictions. <u>There have been successful observations</u> of far UV light with a wavelength of 210 nm.

The student translated 実現し as "implemented". Although we implement such things as "rules", "policies", and "guidelines", we do not generally implement a property, such as luminescence. Returning to the direct object of 実現し, we see that the 動作 in question is the 動作 of a particular type of light-emitting diode. In such a situation we might say that we "achieved operational status (for the LED)" or that we "successfully operated (the LED)". If we incorporate the second option, which sounds more natural, the entire sentence could read like this: \*\*\* We successfully operated a light-emitting diode (LED) using aluminum nitride (AlN), the material that is predicted theoretically to luminesce at the shortest wavelength among all semiconductors, and we were able to observe far-ultraviolet light with a wavelength of 210 nm. \*\*\*

It is worth noting that if we use the word "successfully" as part of the translation for 実現し, we need to consider how to translate the final phrase 観測することに成功した. A literal translation could read "we succeeded in observing ...", but in order to avoid unnecessary repetition it would be better to use the phrase "we were able to observe ...", as indicated above.

The following sentence appeared in a paper dealing with robotic technology:

人間の能力を超えたハイパヒューマン技術を*実現する*ために は、<u>まず</u>人間の能力そのものを的確に<u>把握</u>して<u>おく</u>必要があ る。(6)

In this instance the direct object of 実現する is ハイパヒューマン技術, which we may safely translate as "hyper-human technology". A student provided the following translation:

In order to *materialize* hyper-human technology that exceeds human abilities, it is necessary to accurately grasp human abilities themselves.

This student rendered 実現する as "materialize". The verb "materialize" is a valid word, but this is not the proper context for its use. Among other tasks we may "develop" technology, we may "advance" technology,

we may "refine" technology, and we may "employ" technology, but we do not "materialize" technology. The writer's use of ために suggests that ハイパヒューマン技術を実現する is a goal or an objective to be reached in the future. The use of the connective form 把握して and the auxiliary verb おく indicates that this action (把握する) is being carried out in order to attain some future objective. The introductory word まず places emphasis on the necessity (必要) of carrying out this action "first" in order to ultimately reach the stated objective. The verb 把握する often means "to grip (something)" or "to grasp (something)". The verb "grasp" itself can refer either to the physical act of holding an object in one's hand or to the mental act of gaining a deep understanding of a concept or a situation. In this instance the writer is referring to a mental act, and that point should be made clear in the translation. A translation that incorporates all of these thoughts could read like this:

> \*\*\* <u>Before</u> we can bring to reality/commercialize/successfully develop/implement hyper-human technology—technology that exceeds the capabilities of humans—we must <u>first gain</u> a detailed <u>understanding</u> of those very capabilities. \*\*\*

Based on the content of the sentence alone any one of the four alternatives provided here for 実現する would be reasonable. Careful reading of the entire paragraph in which this sentence appears would be needed in order to determine which of the alternatives is best.

In this example we have seen the same verb (実現する) combined with three different direct objects, and we have chosen a different translation for 実現する in each case. The range of possible translations for 実現 makes this word a useful tool for teaching students the importance of context in determining the intended meaning of a word Translation Quarterly No. 64

or phrase.

## **Example 4: Level of Emotion**

A book about the Japanese economy contains the following sentence:

### これらを睨みつつ、政府、日銀、民間企業の景気分析担当者 は日々*頭を悩ませている*。(7)

Two students offered the following translations:

While staring at these factors, the government, the Bank of Japan and people from civilian companies in charge of analyzing the economy *worry themselves* everyday.

With this glaring down upon us, economic analysts within the government, the Bank of Japan, or private businesses *are troubled* on a daily basis.

The verb 悩ませる typically indicates "distress", "anxiety", or perhaps even "torment". The range of emotions covered by this verb is quite broad, but the specific expression 頭を悩ませる suggests a level of emotional stress on the high end of this range—much higher than these two translations indicate. The verb 睨む could mean "to glare at (someone)" or "to watch in a disapproving manner", but it could also mean "to look intently at (something)", "to concentrate on (something)", or simply "to bear (something) in mind". The pronoun これら refers to trends in economic indicators that the author had described in earlier sections. From the context we understand that it is through the process of analyzing these economic indicators that the 景気分析担当者 are 頭を悩ませている.

The first student assumed that the 景気分析担当者 work only for 民間企業, but the second student assumed that all three nouns (政 府, 日銀, and 民間企業) modify the topic. In fact, the government, the Bank of Japan and corporations employ economic analysts, so the second interpretation is probably correct. The second student misunderstood the direct object of the verb 照, but the first student recognized that the analysts work with data. The first student translated 民間企業 as "civilian companies", while the second student chose "private businesses". Usually, the word "civilian" is used in contrast to "military", but that distinction is not relevant in this instance. It is not clear whether the English phrase "private businesses" is intended to refer specifically to "privately held companies"-i.e., those companies whose stock is not traded on public exchanges-or whether the student intended to encompass any non-governmental company or corporation. The term 民間企業 usually carries the second meaning; a phrase such as "the private sector" would eliminate any confusion in this regard. A translation that takes all of these features into account could read like this:

\*\*\* Every day economic analysts in the government, the Bank of Japan, and the private sector **rack their brains** as they carefully watch these trends. \*\*\*

## **Example 5: Sense and Sensation**

The character 感 is associated with the five senses, as well as

#### Translation Quarterly No. 64

many words related to emotions, feelings, and sensations of various types. In a paper describing the development and testing of a new engine for a sporty car the authors write the following:

## <u>環境性能</u>を確保し、かつ「*伸び感*」、「レスポンス」、「サウン ド」の三つの<u>感性</u>に訴えかける性能を追求したエンジンを実 現させた。(8)

The character 感 appears twice in this sentence: once in the word 伸び 感 and once in the word 感性. The authors state clearly that 伸び感, u スポンス, and t ウ ン F are three specific 感性 that the engineers had in mind as they designed the engine. A student suggested this translation:

> Performance that maintained environmental performance and moreover appealed to the driver's three <u>senses</u> of "*stretching emotion*", "response", and "sound" was sought, and this engine was achieved.

The word 性能 is often associated with "performance", particularly

in the context of the performance of a product under certain conditions. The verb 追求する usually means "to seek" or "to pursue", but in the context of the performance of an automobile engine it could mean "to provide (to the driver)". Such performance could "appeal" (訴えかける) to the driver's emotions or it could appeal to the driver through "sensations". The "sound" could be the roar of the engine—something that most people associate with a high-performance automobile. The "response" could be the light touch on the gas pedal that is required in order to accelerate the car. In this context the 伸び感 is likely to be either the "exhilaration" or the "sense of speed" that the engine provides as the driver accelerates or winds his/her way along a twisting road. If we try to combine all of the information we have gained from the individual pieces of the sentence, we may produce something like this:

\*\*\* We developed an engine that could appeal to the driver through the three <u>sensations</u> of "**exhilaration**", "response", and "sound" but could still maintain the vehicle's low environmental impact. \*\*\*

It is worth noting that although the word 性能 appears twice in the original Japanese sentence, it is probably better not to use the word "performance" in both instances. The Japanese term 環境性能 literally means "environmental performance", but the English phrase "environmental impact" would be a better choice. The verb 実現する, which we discussed previously, also appears in this sentence. From the context we understand that the authors designed the engine in question in order to promote customer interest in a particular vehicle. In this instance "developed" seems to be the most appropriate choice for 実 現させた.

The character 感 appears as part of a different term in the following sentence, which was taken from a book about the Japanese economy:

Translation Quarterly No. 64

### <u>最近では</u>、欧州の共通通貨であるユーロが世界の金融取引に おける存在感を高めている。(9)

In this instance 感 is part of the word 存在感, which is usually glossed in dictionaries as "presence (felt by others)" or "sense of existence". A student provided the following translation:

<u>Recently</u> the Euro, which is the common currency of Europe, *raises a sense of existence* as for financial transactions of the world.

The student correctly recognized that the noun ユーロ is the subject of the verb 高めている, but (s)he apparently plugged in a dictionary definition without understanding the meaning of the sentence. The phrase 存在感を高めている literally indicates that someone somewhere is more aware of the presence of the euro as an international currency than was true in the past. That "someone" may be currency traders or people who are engaged in international business. The combination of 最近では and 存在感を高めている suggests that this change began in the recent past and continues to the present. If we translate 最近 as "recently", then the present perfect tense, not the present tense, should be used. The resulting translation would look like this:

> \*\*\* <u>Recently</u> the euro—the common currency of Europe—**has been** attracting more attention in the world's financial transactions. \*\*\*

In a situation such as this, when the word  $\overline{\mathbb{R}}_{\overline{\Sigma}}$  is paired with a verb that indicates an action in progress or an ongoing change, another option would be to translate  $\overline{\mathbb{R}}_{\overline{\Sigma}}$  as "these days" and to employ the present progressive tense, rather than the present perfect tense.

\*\*\* <u>These days</u> the euro—the common currency of Europe—**is playing a larger role** in the world's financial transactions. \*\*\*

If we compare these two translations, we realize that the first option places more emphasis on the fact that this change began in the recent past and the second option places more emphasis on the fact that this change continues into the present. Depending upon the overall context of the document one translation or the other may be preferable. It is worth noting that as we thought about each of these sentences we refined our translation in several stages. At each step along the way we used the context as a guide for making choices among options for the meanings of individual words and for putting words and phrases together to form the overall sentence.

# Example 6: Loanwords and False Friends

Linguistic borrowing enriches languages all over the world. Many loanwords carry into their adopted languages the same meanings that the original words held in their original languages. However, almost every language allows for the possibility that a loanword could take on a new meaning in its adopted language—a meaning that might not be obvious to someone who is familiar with the original word in the original language. Translators often use the term "false friends" (or "faux amis") to describe the loanword in the adopted language and the original word in the original language. A book about the Japanese economy contains this sentence:

#### 日本の住宅投資に占める*住宅リフォーム*(<u>増改築</u>)の割合は

Translation Quarterly No. 64

### 約三割となっており、イギリスの六二%、ドイツの五〇%と 比べるとかなり低いことがわかる。(10)

At first glance the loanword リフォーム appears to correspond to the English word "reform". If so, the term 住宅リフォーム would logically correspond to the widely used phrase "housing reform". ("Housing reform" is normally associated with a government policy or program that is designed to make home ownership accessible on an equal basis to a wide segment of a given population.) Based on this understanding a student submitted the following translation:

*Housing reform* (the <u>extension/reconstruction</u> of existing buildings) makes up approximately 30% of Japan's housing investment; when compared to England's 62% and Germany's 50%, it is considerably lower.

The first hint that 住宅リフォーム has nothing to do with "housing reform" comes from the character-based explanation 増改築 that appears in parentheses immediately after the term in question. The student focused on the meanings of the three individual characters and rendered this explanation as "the extension/reconstruction of existing buildings". If we assume that this term is intended to encompass projects such as adding another room to an existing home or redoing the kitchen, then a more natural alternative might be "additions or alterations to existing buildings". With this understanding of the character-based explanation in hand we realize that the term 住宅リフォーム actually corresponds to "home remodeling", "home renovation", or "home improvement". If so, the entire sentence could be rendered like this:

\*\*\* Approximately 30% of Japan's housing investment is devoted to

**home remodeling/renovation/improvement** (additions or <u>alterations</u> to existing buildings). This figure is quite low in comparison with that of England (62%) or Germany (50%). \*\*\*

The loanword  $1/7 \neq -\Delta$  certainly qualifies as a "false friend" in this instance. The context, in the form of the character-based explanation, provided enough information to overcome the "misdirection" that we may have experienced when we read the sentence initially.

### **Example 7: Specific vs. General**

The character  $\pm$  is most frequently associated with the specific concept of "world", but it can also carry a more general meaning: "society", "era", "generation", or "lifetime". The following sentence, taken from a book about the Japanese economy, contains the common phrase  $\pm \mathcal{O} \oplus$ :

### 日銀は資金の需要と供給のメカニズムを通じて金利をコント ロールし、*世の中*の景気を調整している。(11)

In this sentence 世の中 modifies the noun 景気. A student translated the sentence in this way:

The Bank of Japan controls interest rates by using the mechanisms of capital supply and demand, and through this regulates the economic conditions *of the entire world*.

The term 日銀 is a common abbreviation for 日本銀行 (the Bank of

Japan), the Japanese central bank. This translation asserts that the Bank of Japan can, by virtue of its interest rate policy, regulate "the economic conditions of the entire world'. Not even the head of the Bank of Japan would claim that his institution has that much power. This assertion alone makes us return to the original sentence for a more careful examination. It appears that the student read the phrase  $\# \mathcal{D} \oplus$  and thought that it was equivalent to 世界中. The term 世界中 does indeed mean "all over the world" or "throughout the entire world" in the sense of our entire planet. However, the phrase 世の中 could mean "the world" in the very vague sense of the comings of goings of the people around us, it could refer to "society", or it could mean "the times" in the sense of the events that occur around some individual observer. during a particular period in history. If we begin with the assumption that the Bank of Japan can only exercise direct control over economic events within Japan, and we recognize that a Japanese economist has written this book for a Japanese audience, we may safely conclude that 世の中の景気 refers to the Japanese economy or economic conditions within Japan. This leads us to the following translation:

\*\*\* The Bank of Japan uses the mechanism of supply and demand of capital to control interest rates. In this way it regulates economic conditions/the economy (**around us**). \*\*\*

This translation suggests that depending upon the way in which we integrate this particular sentence into the larger context of the paragraph in which it appears, it may not even be necessary to translate  $\boxplus \mathcal{O} \oplus$  explicitly. If we do decide to translate  $\boxplus \mathcal{O} \oplus$  at all, a vague sense of "the economy around us" would be sufficient in this particular instance. This same Japanese phrase appears in two other sentences that appear in the same book:

#### しかし、世の中にはもっと様々な形態の金融取引がある。(12)

物価とは、世の中全般の価格動向のことだ。(13)

The subject of sentence 12 is 金融取引, and the setting for the main clause is simply 世の中. A student translated this sentence as follows:

That said, the bank has financial dealings in a variety of forms worldwide.

Sentence 12 appeared in the same paragraph as sentence 11, although the sentences were not consecutive. The sentences between sentence 11 and sentence 12 dealt with purchases of Japanese government bonds by the Bank of Japan as a means to stimulate the Japanese economy. This student made the same error regarding  $\oplus \mathcal{O} \oplus$  that a different student made in sentence 11. In addition, this student assumed that the Bank of Japan was the unstated topic of this sentence. In fact, there is no unstated topic; this sentence focuses on transactions, not the organizations that make such transactions. Because the subject (金融 取引) is "financial transactions", the setting ( $\oplus \mathcal{O} \oplus$ ) is probably "the business world" or "the world of finance". Thus, the intended meaning of sentence 12 would be more like this:

> \*\*\* However, in the business world there exist financial transactions in a much wider variety of forms. \*\*\*

Sentence 13 functions as a definition of the term 物価, which is glossed in some dictionaries as "prices" and in some dictionaries as "commodity prices". However, in the business world and in the media the term "commodity prices" normally refers to the prices of agricultural products and materials that are mined or otherwise extracted from the

#### Translation Quarterly No. 64

ground. Such products are frequently purchased in bulk by companies or traded on commodity exchanges. Examples of commodities include corn, wheat, crude oil, coal, iron ore, and bauxite. As sentence 13 indicates, the term 物価 carries a much broader meaning. A student translated this sentence as follows:

*Commodity prices* is the trend in the cost of *everything in the world as a whole.* 

There are two significant issues in this sentence: 物価 and 世の中. In order to ensure the integrity of the entire sentence our translations for these two portions must be compatible. If 物価 is "prices", then 価格 動向 could refer to "the trend in the cost" in 世の中全般. (In principle the word 価格 could be "cost" or "price". If we are defining "prices", we cannot very well use "price" in the definition. In this instance "cost" is the preferred alternative.) We typically monitor prices for an individual country or for a particular geographical region. Rather than the clearly defined meaning for 世の中 that we encountered in sentence 12, this sentence seems to favor the more vague sense ("around us") that we observed in sentence 11. (This is consistent with the broad meaning of "prices" for 物価.) If so, then 世の中全般 would mean "everything around us" or "all of the items around us", and we could translate sentence 13 in this way:

\*\*\* Prices reflect the trend in the cost of all the things we buy. \*\*\*

If we think about the content of this sentence, we realize that another concept that is related to the trend in the cost of various items is the "cost of living". If we rearrange the wording to incorporate this concept, we could translate sentence 13 as follows: \*\*\* The cost of living reflects the movement of prices for purchases (in general). \*\*\*

In this instance the optional phrase "in general" provides the sense of scale or sense of scope that we obtain from 世の中全般 in the original sentence. Depending upon the overall flow of information in the paragraph from which the original sentence was taken, either the first or the second translation may be more suitable.

# **Example 8: Maintaining vs. Improving**

The word 整備 has two meanings. It could mean "maintenance", "servicing", or "upkeep" in the sense of keeping machinery or facilities in good working order. It could also mean "development", "improvement", or "expansion" in the sense of enhancing the capabilities of machinery or facilities. A book about the Japanese economy contained the following passage:

### <u>進出先</u>で生産体制を*整備*していかなければならない。地域で 歓迎してくれ、行政の協力で*整備*が進むと、だんだんと生産 が<u>軌道に乗ってくる</u>。(14)

The term 整備 appears twice in this passage, which was part of a discussion of Japanese companies shifting production facilities from Japan to other countries in order to reduce operating costs. A student translated these two sentences as follows:

In <u>the place of advancement</u> the company has to be *maintaining* production systems. If it is welcomed by the region and *maintenance* is

progressing with the cooperation of the administration, eventually production will become financially stable.

Keeping in mind that the passage pertains to the movement of production facilities, we realize that 進出先 must refer to the location to which the facilities have been moved or "the new location". Because this is a new location, the primary challenge for the company is to put into place a production system that operates efficiently and with the necessary level of quality. This suggests that the intended meaning of 整備 falls into the "development" category, rather than the "maintenance" category. The final clause contains the phrase 軌道に乗 つてくる, which the student translated as "become financially stable". However, the direct object of the verb in the first sentence is 生産体 制, and the subject of the second sentence is 生産. This information suggests that the primary focus at this stage is on production, rather than profit. In this context the expression 軌道に乗る corresponds to a phrase such as "to get on track" or "to move ahead". If we put these ideas together, the translation for passage 14 could read like this:

\*\*\* We must **improve/enhance/upgrade** the production system in the new location. If the new facility is welcomed in that locality and the **improvement/enhancement/upgrade** proceeds with the cooperation of the (local) authorities, production will gradually get on track/move ahead. \*\*\*

Both general meanings for 整備 are widely used, and in this instance it is purely from the context that we are able to select the meaning intended by the original writer.

# Conclusion

In each of the above examples we relied upon context to make key decisions about the intended meaning of a word, a phrase, or an expression. Both the short-range context—i.e., the text that preceded or followed the sentence in question—and the long-range context—i.e., the overall flow of information in the paragraph or document—were used to select certain options or to discard other options when multiple meanings existed for specific terms. Many factors play a role in the creation of a translation that is complete, accurate, and natural sounding, but the importance of context cannot be overemphasized.

### References

- Hasegawa, Yoko (2011). *A Course in Japanese Translation*. London and New York: Routledge.
- Refsing, Kirsten and Lita Lundquist (2009). *Translating Japanese Texts*. Copenhagen: Museum Tusculanum.
- Sofer, Morry (2002). Translator Self-Training—Japanese: A Practical Course in Technical Translation. New York: Schreiber, Shengold Publishing.

### About the Author

James L. Davis is Professor and Director of the Technical Japanese Program in the Department of Engineering Professional Development at the University of Wisconsin-Madison. A licensed Professional Engineer, he has worked as a chemical engineer in industry, has conducted research as a Fulbright Graduate Fellow at Kyoto University, and has been teaching technical Japanese at the University of Wisconsin since 1990. He is the author of *Intermediate*  Translation Quarterly No. 64

*Technical Japanese*, published by the University of Wisconsin Press. Davis is certified by the American Translators Association (ATA) in Japanese-into-English translation and served as Administrator of the Japanese Language Division of the ATA from 1993-95. He currently serves as a judge for the Japanese-into-English portion of the JAT Contest for New and Aspiring Translators.



# 翻譯作為文化間的橋梁 —— A Critical History of New Music in China

### 楊燕宜

語言是一種由語音、語法、詞匯和語義組成表情達意的符號 系統,不僅用於交流,也是對事物認知的必要工具。語言作為一 種符號系統並不是抽象的、而是產生於一定的自然和文化環境, 呈現出特定的思維方式和文化特徵。準確地說,語言是文化的編 碼符號。不同地區、不同文化環境所產生的語言系統有很大差 異,因此不同語言文字在互譯時難免會產生誤解和偏差。

翻譯是令人敬佩的工作。譯者不僅需要掌握原語和譯語,還 需要了解兩種語言的文化背景和思維邏輯。翻譯實際上是在不同 文化的作者和讀者間構建溝通的橋樑。嚴復認為譯事有三大難, 即"信、達、雅"。"信"指譯文既要真實呈現原文內容,也要 反映原作風格;"達"是"辭達而已"中的"達",是達旨的意 思;"雅"則指一種標準和境界。對翻譯者來說,要做到"信、 達、雅",除熟練掌握原語、譯語以及翻譯技巧之外,也需要對 原語文化背景、原文作者寫作風格等進行深入了解。對於人文學 科類文本的翻譯尤其如此。譯者對詞義概念的理解、對語言風格 的把握都決定了譯文的準確度和恰當性。

#### 《翻譯季刊》第六十四期

本文討論《中國新音樂史論》(劉靖之著)的英文版本 A Critical History of New Music in China (梅凱爾, Caroline Mason 譯, 香港中文大學出版社 2010 年出版)中的翻譯特點、風格,並對 由其中某些中文專有名詞和概念的翻譯引發的問題作出進一步的 探討。

### 一、歷史陳述、音樂文獻及相關譯文

《中國新音樂史論》(增訂版,音樂時代出版社,2009)是 一本專業性學術著作。從受眾對象來看,目標讀者首先是英文語 言區域裏了解、學習和研究中國文化的群體,其次是一些中國音 樂文化的愛好者。劉靖之在書中論述了中國近現代音樂的形成和 發展過程及其產生的原因和影響。

該書主要內容有:(一)歷史陳述、人物引言;(二)歷史 事件及音樂作品的評論;(三)音樂文獻及相關資料。譯者需要 分門別類地處理文字信息,並採取不同的翻譯策略和方法。

對於歷史陳述和評論的翻譯,譯者採用了直譯的方法,客觀 地呈現了歷史事實。

例(1)

原文:

一八八五年左右,赫特出資購買樂器、樂譜、中式制服,並招募一 批中國人,在天津開班訓練。不到一年,其中八名隊員到北京負責 訓練另一批學員。後來,赫特又聘請葡萄牙教練恩格諾(E.E.

#### 翻譯作為文化間的橋樑

Encarnacao)來北京擔任教練。天津的樂隊歸入直隸總督府,成為中國歐洲軍樂隊的先驅。(27頁)

譯文:

In about 1885 Hart purchased instruments, music and Chinese-style uniforms, recruited a group of Chinese in Tianjin to form a brass band and taught them to play Western music. Within a year, eight members of this group moved to Beijing and began training another group of learners, under the supervision of a Portuguese teacher, E. E. Encarnacao, whom Hart had also hired to come to Beijing. The office of the Governor-General of Zhili then assumed responsibility for the Tianjin band, thus launching the development of China's Western-style military bands. (p. 24)

上例譯文以原文語言為依據,不需要過多的其他文化傳遞手段, 要簡單、明瞭。

下一段文字呈現出新中國建立不久後特定的時代特徵。譯者 對此也採取了直譯的方法,但歷史和文化信息自然隱含在譯文 中,讀者能夠真實地感受到這段文字所產生時代的社會背景。

例(2)

原文:

呂驥說:團結和培養大批音樂工作者參加祖國的建設事業。具體工作時:鼓舞工農勞動人民努力生產、建設自己的祖國,創造自己的文明和幸福。鼓舞人民的部隊提高文化,掌握近代軍事技術,保衛

#### 《翻譯季刊》第六十四期

祖國,保衛人民勝利的果實。概括地說,是反映生產建設,為工農 兵勞動人民服務。(416頁)

#### 譯文:

Lu Ji described the tasks that needed to be done after 1949:

Uniting and training large numbers of music workers to take part in the construction of the motherland. In particular, encouraging the workers, peasants and labouring people to work hard on production, to construct their own motherland and to create their own culture and enjoyment. Encouraging the ranks of the people to improve their cultural level, master modern military techniques, protect the motherland, and the fruits of the people's victory. To sum it all up, we had to mirror production and construction, and serve the workers, peasants, soldiers and labouring people. (p. 305)

另有原作者對歷史的評論,直譯的方式也真實地反映出原作 者的觀點和文字風格:

例(3)

原文:

縱觀建國後十七年的新音樂發展,我們不難發覺中共文藝思想,以 及由此而訂出來的政策對音樂發展所造成的影響。而中共的文藝思 想又離不開二十世紀初,或甚至十九世紀末便開始了的"中西文化 關係"上的爭論。(491頁)

#### 翻譯作為文化間的橋樑

譯文:

When we look at the development of New Music in the 17 years after the founding of the PRC, it is not hard to understand Communist thinking on literature and art, and the effect the policies formulated on the basis of such thinking had on this development. The views of the Communists were still closely linked to the debates about the connection between China and Western culture that had begun in the early twentieth century, or even the late nineteenth century. (p. 366)

除上述及類似段落之外,原作中展示了大量音樂歷史文獻, 其中一部分是歌曲。歌詞反映特定的社會生活和個人情感,並具 有一定的文學性,對這部分內容的翻譯需要根據不同歌詞內容及 風格特徵,斟酌譯文的恰當表達方式。

梅凱爾對中文歌詞的理解和把握相當準確。在原作第二章 "新音樂的源起"一節中,作者介紹了"學堂樂歌"的形成和發展,其中重點介紹了以愛國思想為內容的,以及抒發個人情感兩 種不同類型的歌曲改編和創作。譯文準確地體現了原作的風格神 韻,如以下二例所示。

例(4)

原文:

向前向前,奮勇爭先!

向前向前,伸我自主權!

抖擻精神,唤起國魂,

思獨立,心如百煉金堅。

#### 《翻譯季刊》第六十四期

把微驅為國捐, 羞偷生,怕神州互解難全。

#### 譯文:

Onward, onward, let's muster our courage and see who can be first! Onward, onward, extend to us the right to self-determination! Let's brace ourselves, let's summon up the nation's soul, Dreaming of independence, hearts hard as tempered metal, Let's lay down our trivial lives for our country, Life without honour is shameful, and we dread the partition of this sacred land. (p. 67)

例(5) 原文: 月(李叔同) 仰望空明明, 朗月懸太清。 瞰下界擾擾, 塵欲迷中道。 惟願靈光普萬方, 蕩滌垢滓揚芬芳。 虛渺無極, 聖潔神秘, 靈光常仰望。

#### 翻譯作為文化間的橋樑

譯文:

#### The moon

Look up into the bright, bright sky, Where the moon hangs shining in the void. Look down on the chaos of the world below, Where dust all but obscures the middle way. If only that magical light could reach everywhere, Cleaning away the dirt and spreading fragrance. Infinitely distant, Holy and mysterious,

That magical light we shall look up to for ever. (p. 53)

對這兩類歌詞的翻譯不僅需要考慮內容,還需要在文字上反 覆斟酌。譯文要在用詞和文字風格上與原文貼切。兩首歌詞讀起 來有不同的節奏和韻律感。前一首(例 4)鏗鏘有力,表現出年 輕人堅定的革命決心。特別是最後一句中,用 Life without honour is shameful 來詮釋中文的"怕偷生"非常合適。第二首(例 5) 是李叔同的詩。詩人在當時已感受到生命的孤獨,宿命感流露於 短短的詩句中。譯者把握了這種寂寞的心境,在用詞上力圖貼近 原詩,讀來韻味十足。譯者對歌詞和詩句的翻譯顯示出很深的文 化功底,這些段落可謂優秀之作。

原書總字數為 5 萬之多,譯書多採用了直譯的方式,歌詞的 譯文則突出了時代性、文學性和藝術性。本文選取上述有代表性 的段落用以說明譯書的特點。

在這裏需要指出的是,譯書對歌詞的文字編排稍欠合理。可

#### 《翻譯季刊》第六十四期

能考慮到讀者群體多為漢學人士,譯書對歌詞採用了"先拼音、 後譯文"的編排方法,其用意顯然是為讀者提供中文朗讀依據。 其實這種做法並不能滿足讀者所盼。原因有二:由於缺少音標注 釋,長段的拼音詩句不具可讀性,也使版面顯得奇怪;再者,拼 音不能替代漢字展示詩句的文學性,所以是多餘的。

譯書中的歌名以及一系列曲目名稱、文章名稱等都有同樣情況。只有拼音沒有漢字,既不是原名又不是漢譯名,如"Zhiqu Weihushan"(智取威虎山)和"Qixi Beihutuan"(奇襲白虎團)。這樣的劇目名稱用拼音讀來不僅有些麻煩,而且漢字的詞義和文學形象也不復存在了。書中甚至有一些較長文章的題目是用拼音來呈現的,看上去更加不舒服,如:"Lin Biao tongzhi weituo Jiang Qing tongzhi zhaokai de Budui Wenyi Gongzuo Zuotanhui jiyao"(p. 378)。

對於有漢學知識的人士來說,只有拼音沒有漢字實在是學術 上的欠缺;而對於不具備漢學知識的人士來說,讀拼音只能使其 更加迷茫。當然這並非完全屬於譯者之過。

中文排版和校對都是專業性很強的工作,英文出版機構通常 缺乏這樣的專業人才資源。這種無奈之舉是可以理解的。究竟是 省略拼音只用譯文,還是通過其他合作形式或技術手段解決此類 問題是值得商榷的話題。對於中文出版機構來說,如遇上述問 題,在排版時是原文在先,譯文在後,還是譯文在先,原文在 後,也是需要謹慎處理的。隨着國際文化交流日益頻繁,出版業 在這方面定會越來越多地遇到類似問題。專業學術論著應該充分 體現其專業水準和學術價值。

# 二、中文專有名詞及特定概念的 解讀和翻譯

該書的翻譯工作中,最為棘手的當屬對中國傳統音樂中一些 概念的翻譯。其中較為突出的問題牽涉中國表演藝術中一些專有 名詞,例如中國戲曲、歌舞劇、秧歌劇……等。書中將中國傳統 戲曲譯為"traditional Chinese drama",這種譯法欠妥而且不準 確。中國文化中的"劇"與西方文化中的 drama 有所不同。 Drama 是指由古希臘悲劇發展而來的戲劇表演形式。在西方文化 被介紹至中國之前,中國沒有西方意義上的"戲劇"。中國傳統 戲曲形式有劇情,是音樂、歌唱、舞蹈、武術和雜技的綜合藝術 形式。把戲曲譯為 drama 與中國傳統文化不夠契合。當然,在兩 種文化之間找到完全能夠對應的詞是困難的,譯者需要以研究的 態度做必要的功課,並經過縝密思考,選擇相對貼近中國傳統文 化特徵的詞,筆者認為,對中國傳統戲曲這一概念的翻譯,以 "traditional Chinese theater" 更為妥賞。

由此延伸的是對"京劇"一詞的翻譯。京劇通常被譯為 "Peking Opera"。究竟是何人第一次使用了"Opera"已很難也 無須考證。按照一般的推理和判斷,"Peking Opera"可能是非 藝術專業的英語專家根據大眾的約定俗成而後被學術界延用。它 的不妥之處有二:第一,Opera 的基礎是 drama,如不應把戲曲 譯為 drama,當然京劇也不應譯為"Opera"。第二,只有京劇被 譯為 "Peking Opera",而其他地方戲曲則沒有或少有這樣的譯 法,由此造成概念的不統一。以該書為例,京劇的英文是 "Opera",而其他戲曲的譯文則用拼音,如滬劇譯為"huju",

#### 《翻譯季刊》第六十四期

豫劇譯為"yuju"(而非 Shanghai Opera、Henan Opera)等。另 外,戲曲是一個整體的內涵性概念,京劇或其他劇種則是戲曲所 涵蓋的外延性屬性。按書中所譯(也是習慣用法)有關"中國戲 曲"在總體和分類上的翻譯就不統一了。下表是兩種譯法的對 比:

中文	譯法1	譯法 2
中國戲曲	traditional Chinese drama	traditional Chinese theater
京劇	Peking Opera	Jingju
滬劇	Huju	Huju

需要說明的是,出現上述情況並非譯者主觀所為,而是採用 了前人的譯法。但筆者認為,針對以往沒有經過仔細斟酌的譯 法,即使已經約定成俗也可以再討論或修改。對於中國戲曲表演 藝術在整體層面的譯法如採用"traditional Chinese theater",下 屬各劇種均用拼音形式更為合適。把中國戲曲譯為 drama 不夠準 確,也使得在該譯書中難免地出現了一些文字上的糾結。例如, 381 頁第二自然段有這樣一句話: "The category of traditional drama (xiqu) actually covers many types of traditional Chinese dramatic entertainment"。在這裏,譯者必須用括弧中的拼音對 traditional drama 加以注釋,否則整句話看上去就令人費解了。但即使加上 拼音注釋,整個句子讀來也不舒服。一個看似很小的用詞問題, 使得簡單的句子變得難懂,可見 "概念"之重要。如果該中文句 譯為"The category of traditional theater actually covers many types

#### 翻譯作為文化間的橋樑

of traditional Chinese dramatic entertainment",就會使整個句子流暢一些,並讓人容易理解。

對翻譯,特別是對一些專有名詞或特定概念的翻譯之所以需 要這樣"較真",是因為翻譯肩負着傳播文化的責任,如果翻譯 中出現概念上的偏差,在文化傳播的過程中,這些概念就會變得 越來越模糊,甚至造成"以訛傳訛"。以上述概念為例,如果把 西方藝術表演中的概念套用到中國傳統表演藝術,就會使中國傳 統藝術失去特色。京劇是中國特有的,與西方任何一種表演藝術 都不相同,所以用音譯的方法更為合適。

英譯漢也存在同樣的問題,有時還會反過來對漢譯英產生影響。還是以"opera"為例。"Opera"是"opus"(作品)的複數形式,不論從詞意還是從其構成要素來說,都不僅僅是唱歌的劇。把opera 譯為"歌劇",久而久之,人們自然地就會把它理解為"唱歌的劇"。當然,絕對準確的翻譯是不可能的,譯者需要盡力而為。讀者,特別是學者也需要對譯文仔細揣摩、深入學習。楊燕迪在他譯著《作為戲劇的歌劇》的序言中對"opera"和中譯"歌劇"的問題進行過專門的說明,並提醒眾人,對外來的 "異種"藝術的理解需要雙倍的努力和耐心。

中國近現代時期出現了一些歌舞類的綜合藝術形式和社團, 例如歌舞劇,歌劇社等,是一種世俗藝術形式和團體,與西方歌 劇、舞劇並無關聯。如把"明月歌劇社"直接譯為 Mingyue Opera Association,就把兩個文化中的兩種不同的表演藝術形式混為一 談了。A Critical History of New Music in China 一書中兩次出現"明 月歌劇社"。在 153 頁,譯者根據原文"聯華影業公司音樂舞蹈 學校("明月歌劇社")翻譯: "... Nie Er was accepted at the

#### 《翻譯季刊》第六十四期

Lianhua Films Enterprise Company's School of Music, Song and Dance (formerly known as the Minyue Opera Association)"。因"明月歌 劇社"出現在括弧中,以說明是"聯華影業音樂舞蹈學校的別 稱",所以不會出現誤會。但如果沒有"聯華影業音樂舞蹈學 校"在先, "明月歌劇社"獨立出現,並被直接譯為"Minyue Opera Association",讀者對此的理解可想而知。譯書 161 頁, 譯者對"明月歌劇社"的譯法是先拼音,譯文放在括弧中: "he went on to form the Mighue gejushe (Mingyue Opera Association) ...",雖然將"歌劇社"譯為"Opera Association"仍然不妥,但 在沒有更好譯法的情況下,這種先呈現中文名稱,後加譯文的方 法是值得讚許的。遺憾的是在該書中,對這一機構組織的譯法前 後不統一,給人以不夠嚴謹之感。

譯者對秧歌一詞的翻譯首先用拼音,之後在括弧中加以解 釋:Yangge (a kind of rural folk-song),這種譯法值得提倡。但在 書中也同時出現了 yangge opera, yangge drama 的譯法。雖然其 所指不是原始秧歌,而是以秧歌為藝術形式的創作,但這種譯法 不免有些大詞小用。同理,書中將兒童歌舞劇譯為"children's sing-and-dance drama"也是不合適的。

對一些專有名詞的翻譯究竟應該是音譯還是意譯,是一個很 難一概而論的問題。意譯可以讓人大致了解所言之意,但容易導 致譯語使用者根據自己的母語去理解原語。而過多的專有名詞被 音譯之後會讓人感覺是在使用外文,難免有累贅之感。中華民族 的思維方式偏重實用性,所以對許多外來名詞都希望有讓自己明 白其意的傾向,對西文的中譯傾向於意譯。"奏鳴曲"、"復 調"、"小提琴"等雖然多從日語對西文翻譯的借用而來,卻容

易被中國人接受,因為這是一個東方化了的嫁接結果。

音譯的優勢在於不會產生概念混亂。如"芭蕾",芭蕾由 "Ballet"的發音而來,不會與任何一種其他舞蹈形式產生混淆。 在 A Critical History of New Music in China 一書中,譯者把現代舞劇 中的《白毛女》和《紅色娘子軍》歸類為"revolutionary modern ballets",但有時卻譯為 revolutionary modern dance drama。兩者 比較,還是第一種譯法更為簡單、明確、合適。

翻譯工作經常苦於找不到兩種語言中接近的詞,在這種情況 下只能造字。音譯、意譯或音譯加意譯都可能臨界造詞,英譯漢 的"因特網",漢譯英的"Tai Chi"等都是很好的例子。Tai Chi 雖然有動作,但永遠不會被理解為體操;因特網也不會與任何一 個相關中文詞相混淆。

在中譯英時,英文對中文的專有名詞有些採用音譯,如在音 樂領域中,把二胡譯為 "erhu"、把彈詞譯為 "tanci"等。但另 有一些名詞的翻譯則是套用了西方音樂的概念,如:把京劇中的 散板譯為 "rubato",這種譯法明顯詞不達意。"散板"是指將 節拍、節奏自由處理的演唱形式(在無明確節拍、節奏規律的情 況下,速度也失去了意義),也是將詩句進行音調處理的浪漫吟 誦方式;而 rubato 則是指速度的彈性處理,在音樂的節拍、節奏 不改變情況下的速度彈性變化(也可理解為前邊變化了的速度在 後邊予以恢復)。所以把散板譯為 rubato 容易造成對散板的誤 解。

在關於音樂的英語文獻中,梁銘越的 Music of the Billion 很值得借鑒。梁先生將京劇中的散板、導板、搖板以及回龍等都採用了音譯,並加以解釋:

There are four major kinds of free meter: (a) yaoban "emotional free meter" in a slow tempo with an embellished fiddle accompaniment to the voice, (b) sanban "scattered meter" with a unison fiddle accompaniment to the voice, (c) daoban "stepped meter" with gradual, ascending contour motion, and (d) huilong "returning dragon" which is a brief transitional section between the "stepped meter" and 2/4 yuanban meter. (Liang 1985: 245-246)

這種音譯並加解釋的方法非常客觀,不會產生概念模糊、引 發歧義。梅凱爾在處理京劇中的專業術語時,也採用拼音的方 法,如:jing,dan,sheng,mo,chou(淨、旦、生、墨、丑)和 changqiang(唱腔)等,但沒有注釋。在原書中,這些專業術語是 不需要解釋的,而在譯書中沒有解釋,對讀者來說是一種挑戰。 如果梅凱爾能夠以"譯者注"的形式對這些名詞加以簡單的解 釋,不僅可以為讀者豐富知識,提供方便,也會使譯文更加具有 文化內涵,更加精彩。

對上述問題的探討已經超出了 A Critical History of New Music in China 一書的範圍。這部譯著引發出的一些思考,對今後的翻 譯工作是有意義的,這也是筆者的本意。

另外, A Critical History of New Music in China 中涉及的一個對 中文概念的翻譯也值得商權。梅凱爾將原著中"音樂創作"一詞 譯為"creation",相應的便有"新音樂創作",譯為"creation of new music", "民歌創作"譯為"folk song creation"。音樂創 作其實就是作曲,在英文中只有"composition"一詞。中文之所 以有"音樂創作"和"作曲"之分,是因為這兩個詞雖然在中文

中意思近似,但意味卻不同。音樂創作是名詞,傾向於音樂工作 分類的含義;而作曲是動詞,一般定位在創意性音樂寫作。作為 名詞出現的"音樂創作"較作為動詞出現的"作曲"顯得更為廣 泛和有內涵。同理,"鋼琴演奏"和"彈琴"並非事實不同,卻 有雅、俗之別。這裏體現的是一種中國式的語感。不是以中文作 為母語的人,很難覺察到其間的細微差異。對梅凱爾在這一詞上 的翻譯提出批評,雖然顯得有些吹毛求疵,但這一細節反映出的 問題是對中國語言文化內涵的深刻理解,也是對西方文化中一些 概念正確應用的要求。

Creation 原本是一個宗教性、哲學性很強的詞。在西方用它 形容神話的誕生、超自然事物的起源等。在當代社會, creation 一 詞被世俗化。對這一詞在通俗性語言中的出現不必過於認真對 待,但對它在學術性論著中的使用則需要謹慎。Creation 是指超 越性的事物,而一般性的音樂創作(作曲)不屬於此類。當然, 如果梅凱爾把中國的新音樂當作是一種全新的事物,認為必須用 creation 來說明,是可以接受的。但把"民歌創作"譯為"folk song creation"則十分欠妥。譯者很可能對中文"音樂創作"和 "作曲"之間的異同不甚了解,又要忠實於原作,所以直接把 "音樂創作"譯為"music creation"。"Music creation"及相關 的詞語在書中多次出現,應該引起足夠的注意。對於這類情況, 譯者必須具備批判性思維,首先弄清"音樂創作"中"創作"的 意思,之後再對中文的詞義做深入的考證和思索,方可制訂出恰 當的翻譯策略。

### 三、結 語

翻譯是一個簡單的同時也是一個複雜的工作。譯者對兩種語 言及其文化背景的把握決定了翻譯的準確性和學術質量。總體來 說, A Critical History of New Music in China 較為真實、準確地呈現 了原作內容,並基本保持了原作的學術性風貌。譯者對某些段 落,特別是對一些歌詞的翻譯,經過了深入研究和縝密思考,無 可挑剔。

本文所探討的幾個中文專有名詞及概念英譯問題,雖然是 《中國新音樂史論》的翻譯中的特殊問題,但卻說明了翻譯過程 中文化研究的重要性。自 19 世紀末以來,中國人借用大量的西 方音樂理論和外邦的音樂作品來改變和發展自己的音樂文化,一 些"中國式"音樂概念由此產生。在中譯英時,譯者需要對當時 的社會背景以及音樂文化現象有所了解,並對此通過一定程度的 調查和考證,方可在翻譯時做到"信、達、雅"。其二,對於中 國傳統音樂,如套用西方音樂概念來翻譯會造成誤解。當譯者對 這方面的知識有所欠缺時,就需要研習、考證和比較其他人的相 關譯法,以獲得音樂文化上的認同,正確構建起兩種文化之間的 橋樑。

通過語言文字構建文化橋樑的基礎,首先是對語義的理解, 也要明白語言所包含的意義內容,包括詞匯意義、語法意義和語 用意義。語義體現了該語言使用民族、個體的思維方式,從概念 和內涵兩個方面反映出該語言使用民族的信仰、價值觀、生活方 式、人文、地理、歷史以及審美心理等。對原語語義的理解是翻 譯工作的基礎。翻譯家劉宓慶就此問題作出過許多論述,在《文

化翻譯論綱》(2007)一書中,他特別針對語義的文化論證原則 對翻譯工作提出以下建議: "詮釋原語文本中的語義疑義必須把 握兩個方面:一是析義(意義),應博覽諸(註)家對同一疑義 的疏解,這是一種橫向的求證;二是析理(邏輯),應將名家之 間加以比較、探究、對孰是孰非作邏輯上的推斷分析"。這些工 作的目的是避免臆斷和傳訛,也是翻譯過程中最為基本的。字典 所提供的只是最為常用或能夠在兩種語言中找到對應關係的詞義 解釋,而從特定的文化語境中去理解詞義,才能獲得更為準確和 全面的認識。正如翻譯家尤金,奈達(2001)所言,掌握兩種文 化比掌握兩種語言甚至更為重要。

翻譯工作是一個不斷磨練的過程,真正完美無缺的譯文是不存在的,但 as good as it gets 是譯者應該追求的,嚴復提出的"信、達、雅"的境界正在於此。

### 參考文獻

Liang, Mingyue (1985). *Music of the Billion*. Wilhelmshaven: Heinrichshofen's Verlag.

劉宓慶(2007),《文化翻譯論綱》,中國對外翻譯出版公司。

楊燕迪(2008),〈歌劇的真諦:以音樂成在戲劇〉,見《作為戲劇的歌劇》,約瑟夫,科爾曼著,楊燕油譯,上海音樂學院出版社。

楊元剛(2008),《英漢辭與文化語義對比研究》,武漢大學出版社。 尤金・奈達(2001),《語言文化與翻譯》,嚴久生譯,內蒙古大學出版 社。 《翻譯季刊》第六十四期

### 作者簡介

楊燕宜教授現任教於上海音樂學院音樂教育系。楊燕宜曾在北京 首都師範大學音樂學院學習,後赴德國基爾大學深造,專攻音樂 教育學和音樂心理學,並獲得博士學位。楊燕宜的教學和研究領 域涉及音樂教育學、音樂心理學以及音樂學等多個學科。她經常 在中國內地和國際會議上演講,並發表論文。為了增進中國與其 他國家在文化教育方面的交流,她近年來也從事中、英文和中、 德文翻譯工作。她的譯著《音樂心理學理論與應用》(Music Psychology in Theory and Application)將於近期由上海音樂學院出 版社出版。

### 稿約凡例

《翻譯季刊》為香港翻譯學會之學報,歡迎中、英文來稿及翻 譯作品(請附原文及作者簡介)。有關翻譯作品及版權問題,請 譯者自行處理。

一、稿件格式

- 1. 請以電郵傳送來稿之電腦檔案。
- 來稿請附 200-300 字英文論文摘要一則,並請注明:

   (1)作者姓名;(2)任職機構;(3)通訊地址/電話/傳真/電子郵件地址。
- 來稿均交學者審評,作者應盡量避免在正文、注釋、頁 屆等處提及個人身份,鳴謝等資料亦宜於刊登時方附 上。
- 4. 來稿每篇以不少於八千字(約16頁)為宜。
- 二、標點符號
  - 書名及篇名分別用雙尖號(《》)和單尖號(〈)),雙尖 號或單尖號內之書名或篇名同。
  - 2. ""號用作一般引號; ''號用作引號內之引號。
- 三、子 目

各段落之大小標題,請依各級子目標明,次序如下: 一、/A./1./a./(1)/(a)

- 四、專有名詞及引文
  - 正文中第一次出現之外文姓名或專有名詞譯名,請附原 文全名。
  - 引用原文,連標點計,超出兩行者,請另行抄錄,每行 入兩格;凡引原文一段以上者,除每行入兩格外,如第

一段原引文為整段引錄,首行需入四格。

- 五、注 釋
  - 請用尾注。凡屬出版資料者,請移放文末參考資料部份。號碼一律用阿拉伯數目字,並用()號括上;正文中之注釋號置於標點符號之後。
  - 参考資料 文末所附之參考資料應包括:(1)作者/編者/譯者;
     (2)書名、文章題目;(3)出版地;(4)出版社;(5) 卷期/出版年月;(6)頁碼等資料,務求詳盡。正文中 用括號直接列出作者、年份及頁碼,不另作注。
- 六、版 權 來稿刊登後,版權歸出版者所有,任何轉載,均須出版者同 意。
- 七、贈閱本 從 2009 年夏天開始,作者可於 EBSCO 資料庫下載已發表的 論文。如有需要,亦可向編輯部申領贈閱本。
- 八、評 審

來稿經本學報編輯委員會審閱後,再以匿名方式送交專家評 審,方決定是否採用。

九、來稿請寄:香港屯門嶺南大學翻譯系轉《翻譯季刊》主編 陳德鴻教授。電郵地址:chanleo@ln.edu.hk。

# **Guidelines for Contributors**

- 1. *Translation Quarterly* is a journal published by the Hong Kong Translation Society. Contributions, in either Chinese or English, should be original, hitherto unpublished, and not being considered for publication elsewhere. Once a submission is accepted, its copyright is transferred to the publisher. Translated articles should be submitted with a copy of the source-text and a brief introduction to the source-text author. It is the translator's responsibility to obtain written permission to translate.
- Abstracts in English of 200-300 words are required. Please attach one to the manuscript, together with your name, address, telephone and fax numbers and email address where applicable.
- 3. In addition to original articles and book reviews, review articles related to the evaluation or interpretation of a major substantive or methodological issue may also be submitted.
- 4. Endnotes should be kept to a minimum and typed single-spaced. Page references should be given in parentheses, with the page number(s) following the author's name and the year of publication. Manuscript styles should be consistent; authors are advised to consult earlier issues for proper formats.
- 5. Chinese names and book titles in the text should be romanised according to the "modified" Wade-Giles or the pinyin system, and then, where they first appear, followed immediately by the Chinese characters and translations. Translations of Chinese terms obvious to the readers (like *wenxue*), however, are not necessary.

#### Translation Quarterly No. 64

- 6. There should be a separate reference section containing all the works referred to in the body of the article. Pertinent information should be given on the variety of editions available, as well as the date and place of publication, to facilitate use by the readers.
- 7. All contributions will be first reviewed by the Editorial Board members and then anonymously by referees for its suitability for publication in *Translation Quarterly*. Care should be taken by authors to avoid identifying themselves. Submissions written in a language which is not the author's mother-tongue should preferably be checked by a native speaker before submission.
- Electronic files of contributions should be submitted to Professor Leo Tak-hung Chan, c/o Department of Translation, Lingnan University, Tuen Mun, Hong Kong. Email address: chanleo@ln. edu.hk.
- 9. Given the accessibility, from summer 2009, of the journal via the EBSCO database, authors will no longer receive complimentary copies unless special requests are made to the Editor.

### 《翻譯季刊》徵求訂戶啟事

香港翻譯學會出版的《翻譯季刊》是探討翻譯理論與實踐 的大型國際性學術刊物,學會會長陳德鴻教授出任主編,學術 顧問委員會由多名國際著名翻譯理論家組成。資深學者,如瑞 典諾貝爾獎評委馬悅然教授、美國學者奈達博士及英國翻譯家 霍克思教授都曾為本刊撰稿。《翻譯季刊》發表中、英文稿 件,論文摘要(英文)收入由英國曼徹斯特大學編輯的半年刊 《翻譯學摘要》。欲訂購的單位或個人,請聯絡

中文大學出版社

- 地 址:香港 新界 沙田 香港中文大學 中文大學出版社
- 電話:+852 2946 5300
- 傳 真:+852 2603 7355 / +852 2603 6692
- 電 郵:cup-bus@cuhk.edu.hk
- 網 址:www.chineseupress.com

# Subscribing to Translation Quarterly

*Translation Quarterly* is published by the Hong Kong Translation Society, and is a major international scholarly publication. Its Chief Editor is the Society's President, Professor Leo Tak-hung Chan, and its Academic Advisory Board is composed of numerous internationally renowned specialists in the translation studies field. The journal has previously included contributions from such distinguished scholars as the Swedish Nobel Prize committee judge Professor Göran Malmqvist, the American translation theorist Dr. Eugene A. Nida, and the English translator Professor David Hawkes. *Translation Quarterly* publishes contributions in both Chinese and English, and English abstracts of its articles are included in *Translation Studies Abstracts*, edited by UMIST, UK. Institutions or individuals who wish to subscribe to the journal should contact:

The Chinese University Press					
Address:	The Chinese University Press				
	The Chinese University of Hong Kong				
	Sha Tin, New Territories, Hong Kong				
Tel:	+852 2946 5300				
Fax:	+852 2603 7355 / +852 2603 6692				
Email:	cup-bus@cuhk.edu.hk				
Website:	www.chineseupress.com				

### **Subscription Information**

- Subscriptions are accepted for complete volumes only
- Rates are quoted for one complete volume, four issues per year
- > Prepayment is required for all orders
- Orders may be made by check (Payable to The Chinese University of Hong Kong) in Hong Kong or US dollars, or by Visa, MasterCard or American Express in Hong Kong dollars
- Orders are regarded as firm and payments are not refundable
- > Rates are subject to alteration without notice

#### Orders and requests for information should be directed to:

The Chinese University Press The Chinese University of Hong Kong Sha Tin, New Territories, Hong Kong Tel: +852 2946 5300 Fax: +852 2603 7355 E-mail: cup-bus@cuhk.edu.hk Web-site: www.chineseupress.com

### TO: The Chinese University Press Fax: +852 2603 7355

**Order Form** 

Please enter my subscription to *Translation Quarterly*, beginning with *No.63 to 66 (2012)*.

Subscription and order	Rates						
1 year	□ HK\$624 / US	\$80					
2 years*	□ HK\$1,123 / U	S\$144					
3 years**	□ HK\$1,498 / US\$192						
Back issues (No.1 – No.62)	□ HK\$180 / US	\$23 each (Please list iss	sue no.	, total	issues.)		
Please circle your choice. Prices are at discount rate, de * 10% discount. ** 20% discount.							
Attached is a check in Hk "The Chinese University				_ made payable to			
□ Please debit my credit car	d account HK\$		. (Please	convert at US\$1 = HK	(\$7.8)		
I would like to pay my order(							
Card No. (including the 3-dig	it security code):						
Expiry Date:							
Cardholder's Name:							
Cardholder's Signature:							
Please send my journal to:							
Name:							
Address:							
Telephone:							
					Ref: 20120213		
中文大学# THE CHINESE UNIVERSIT	The Chine TY PRESS Tel.: +852	ese University Press ese University of Hong Ko 2946 5300 Fax: +852 2 www.chinesenpress.com	2603 7355		hk.edu.hk		